



## USAID WILDLIFE ASIA

Summaries of Consumer Research, Campaign Evaluation Studies and other Literature relevant to Demand for Wildlife Parts and Products in China, Vietnam and Thailand

Elephant – Rhinoceros – Tiger – Pangolin

May 2017

---

## **DISCLAIMER/AUTHORITY**

Prepared for USAID/RDMA under Contract Number **AID-486-I-16-000007** awarded on 08/31/2016 entitled USAID Wildlife project.

This document is made possible by the support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). This document was completed in partial fulfillment of the approved USAID-Wildlife Asia Task Order I of the referenced contract. The issues presented, views expressed and opinions contained in this plan are those of the Family Health International (FHI 360), USAID Wildlife Asia (UWA) project field team, and are not intended as statements of policy of either USAID or the contracting companies. As such, the contents of this document are the sole responsibility of the FHI 360-UWA field team and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government (USG).

## OVERVIEW

Illegal wildlife trafficking is directly responsible for the decline in wildlife populations. The four primary wildlife products that are currently in high demand are elephant ivory, rhino horn, pangolin and tiger products. The principal markets for these products are in China, Thailand, and Vietnam. The USAID Wildlife Asia (UWA) Activity is funded by the Bangkok-based USAID Regional Development Mission for Asia (RDMA) currently managed by IRG, now RTI. The project addresses wildlife trafficking by working to reduce demand of wildlife products and improve regional action to end wildlife crime in Southeast Asia and China. The consumer demand reduction component of this Activity is managed by FHI 360, an IRG/RTI sub-contractor.

USAID Wildlife Asia, through FHI 360, commissioned a Situation Analysis of consumer demand for ivory, pangolin, rhino horn and tiger parts and products in China, Thailand, and Vietnam in order to summarize and synthesize what is already known. The Situation Analysis, conducted from January to February 2017, was the first step in creating an evidence base for a systematic demand reduction program in the three target countries. The Situation Analysis collected, summarized, and synthesized consumer research and evaluation studies of past demand reduction campaigns, and other literature relevant to consumer demand for ivory, pangolin, rhino horn, and tiger products in China, Vietnam and Thailand.

Documents reviewed included publications, gray literature available on the internet, and electronic blogs. Some partner organizations provided reports of research they commissioned. Priorities for collection and analysis included reports of original consumer research and evaluations of demand reduction campaigns focused on the four species of interest in the three priority countries. Google Scholar was the main source of documents. The following key words/search strings were used: “wildlife consumer research,” “wildlife consumer study,” “wildlife demand reduction,” “wildlife consumer behavior change,” “China tiger elephant rhino pangolin,” “Vietnam tiger elephant rhino pangolin,” “Thailand tiger elephant rhino pangolin.” Searches were conducted in English and Vietnamese for publications between the past 10 years.

A summary of each collected study/literature was prepared in order to organize information for the synthesis and analysis. This document contains the summaries of 17 consumer research studies, five campaign evaluation reports and 46 articles, reports, and blogs accessed. The latter cover reports on market trends, articles on wildlife demand reduction in general, opinion pieces, individual blog posts that were shared by colleagues or found from internet searches. Each summary provides information on the following: 1) Title and Year of study; 2) Location and Objectives; 3) Methodology; 4) Key Findings; 5) Recommendations, if any.

The summaries are grouped according to **species** - elephant, rhino, tiger, pangolin, and multi-species (when study/paper covers more than one wildlife species including one or more of the four focal species). The country where the study was conducted is highlighted in color - China (**blue**), Vietnam (**green**), Thailand (**pink**), or multi-country (**yellow**) (where study/paper covers more than one country including one or more of the three target countries). For ready reference, the summaries are also numbered according to species as follows:

Elephant: 101-108  
Rhino: 201-205

Tiger: 301  
Pangolin: 401-404

Multi-species: 501-506  
Other Literature: 601 and 646

# SUMMARIES OF RESEARCH STUDIES, CAMPAIGN EVALUATIONS AND OTHER LITERATURE RELEVANT TO CONSUMER DEMAND FOR WILDLIFE PARTS AND PRODUCTS IN CHINA, VIETNAM AND THAILAND

CHINA	100: Elephant	400: Pangolin
VIETNAM	200: Rhino	500: Multi species
THAILAND	300: Tiger	600: Other literature (across species)
MULTI-COUNTRY		

<b>Elephant</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>101. CHINA Ivory Demand Analysis and Social Marketing Strategy.</b> February 2016. Report by China Market Research Group funded by IFAW.....	<b>7</b>
<b>102. CHINA iThink Campaign - PSA Impact Evaluation on Ivory Trade in China.</b> October 2015. By Rapid Asia for IFAW China. 7	
<b>103. CHINA Ivory: Inside the Mind of the Chinese Consumer.</b> September 2015. Report by The Nature Conservancy and APCO Insight. 10	
<b>104. CHINA Ivory Demand in China.</b> 2014. Horizonkey Research, WildAid, Save The Elephants, and African Wildlife Foundation.10	
<b>105. CHINA Ivory Demand in China.</b> 2012. Report by Horizonkey Research Consultancy Group funded by WildAid. .... 11	
<b>106. CHINA Report on Chinese Residents' Ivory Consumption and Elephant Conservation Awareness.</b> June 2007. Report by Horizonkey. Funded by IFAW.12	
<b>107. MULTI-COUNTRY Reducing Demand for Ivory: An International Study.</b> August 2015. Report by National Geographic... 13	
<b>108. MULTI-COUNTRY Ivory Consumption Study: Qualitative Phase Advisory Board Summary.</b> 2014. Report by National Geographic..... 13	

<b>Rhino</b> .....	<b>15</b>
201. <b>CHINA Rhino Rage: What is Driving Illegal Consumer Demand for Rhino Horn.</b> 2016. Survey report by Horizon Key funded by NRDC.....	15
202. <b>CHINA Rhino Horn Demand.</b> 2012. Report by Horizon Key Research funded by WildAid and African Wildlife Foundation.....	16
203. <b>CHINA Rhino Horn Demand.</b> 2014. Report by Horizonkey Research funded by WildAid and African Wildlife Foundation. ....	16
204. <b>VIETNAM Consumer Research on Rhino Horn Usage in Vietnam.</b> April 2013. Ipsos. TRAFFIC .....	17
205. <b>VIETNAM Demand for rhino horns in Vietnam decreases as a result of Humane Society International and Vietnam CITES Management Authority Partnership Campaign, poll says.</b> October 2014. By Vietnam rhino horn demand reduction campaign. ....	19
<b>Tiger</b> .....	<b>21</b>
301. <b>CHINA Attitudes Toward Consumption and Conservation of Tigers in China.</b> April 2008. Academic article by many affiliations e.g. NFWF, Oxford University, IFAW, WWF. Survey by Horizon Key.....	21
<b>Pangolin</b> .....	<b>22</b>
401. <b>CHINA Report on Chinese Public Attitude to Consumption of Pangolins and Relevant Products.</b> March 2016. Horizon China, Dataway, funded by AITA Foundation.....	22
402. <b>CHINA Pangolins on the Brink.</b> October 2015. Report by WildAid.....	22
403. <b>VIETNAM Pangolins on the Brink.</b> December 2015. Report by WildAid. ....	22
404. <b>VIETNAM Pangolin Consumer Crime in Vietnam: The Results of ENV surveys and enforcement campaigns, 2011-2015 Brink.</b> 2012. Report by ENV.....	23
<b>Multiple Species</b> .....	<b>24</b>

501.	<b>CHINA</b>	<b>Perception, Price and Preference: Consumption and Protection of Wild Animals Used in Traditional Medicine.</b>	June 2014. Journal article led by Chinese Academy of Sciences et al. ....	24
502.	<b>VIETNAM</b>	<b>Consumption of wild animal products in Ho Chi Minh city, Vietnam - Results of resident and student survey.</b>	May 2011. By Wildlife At Risk (WAR), and Faculty of Biology, University of Science, Vietnam, National University Ho Chi Minh City. 24	
503.	<b>VIETNAM</b>	<b>iThink Campaign - Campaign Impact Evaluation in Vietnam.</b>	March 2016. By Rapid Asia for Freeland.....	26
504.	<b>VIETNAM</b>	<b>Identifying and Understanding Consumers of Wild Animal Products in Hanoi, Vietnam: Implications for Conservation Management.</b>	February 2009. By Rebecca Catherine Drury.....	30
505.	<b>THAILAND</b>	<b>iThink Campaign - Campaign Impact Evaluation in Thailand.</b>	January 2016. By Rapid Asia for Freeland. ....	30
506.	<b>THAILAND</b>	<b>iThink Campaign - Campaign Impact Evaluation in Thailand.</b>	July 2013. By Rapid Asia for Freeland. ....	34
<b>Other Literature</b> .....				<b>39</b>
601.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Offline marketing monitoring for ivory in 2016 in China.</b>	2016. IFAW. ....	39
602.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Tiger</i> )	<b>Briefing on the Manufacture of Tiger Bone Wine in China.</b>	2013. Report by EIA. ....	39
603.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Analysis of Trend in Illegal Online Wildlife Trade in China November 2016.</b>	A Research by Internet Research Institute (IRI) .....	40
604.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>“Consumer behavior” change we believe in: Demanding reduction strategy for endangered wildlife.</b>	2014. By Zhao Liu, Zhigang Jiang, Hongxia Fang, Chunwang Li and Zhbin Meng.....	40
605.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Wildlife trade, consumption and conservation awareness in southwest China.</b>	March 2008. Academic article by Beijing Normal University; Conservation International; IFAW.....	41
606.	<b>CHINA</b> ( <i>Pangolin</i> )	<b>Recent pangolin seizures in China reveal priority areas for intervention.</b>	Short running title: Network analysis of China pangolin market. December 2016. Wenda Chengl, Shuang Xingl, Timothy C. Bonebrake. ....	42
607.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Rhino</i> )	<b>Has demand for rhino horn dropped in Vietnam?</b>	October 2014. By Scott I. Robertson, Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS). ....	43

608.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Rhino</i> )	<b>Project proposal: Breaking the brand of rhino horn in Vietnam.</b> By Lynn Johnson, PhD.....	44
609.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Rhino</i> )	<b>Breaking the brand of rhino horn in Vietnam. The first 12 months.</b> 2014. By Lynn Johnson, PhD.....	46
610.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>A matter of attitude: The consumption of wild animal products in Hanoi, Vietnam.</b> A TRAFFIC report 2007 funded by DANIDA.....	48
611.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Exploring urban demand for wild species in Vietnam: Consumer characteristics and the social context of consumption</b> By Rebecca Drury, Fauna & Flora International (FFI).....	50
612.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Rhino</i> )	<b>Shutting down the rhino horn trade.</b> October 2013. By WWF/TRAFFIC Illegal Wildlife Trade Campaign .	51
613.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Evaluating behaviour change interventions: A case study in Vietnam.</b> September 2015. By Alegria Olmedo, Imperial College London (Submitted for the MSc in Conservation Science). .....	51
614.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Commercial wildlife farms in Viet Nam: A problem or solution for conservation? 2008?.</b> Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) .....	53
615.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Vietnam’s illegal ivory trade threatens Africa’s elephants.</b> 2016. By Lucy Vigne and Esmond Martin. Save the Elephants.....	54
616.	<b>VIETNAM</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>The Social Trade Network: Facebook’s Relationship Status with Wildlife Traders in Vietnam.</b> 2016. Nguyen. T. 2016. The social trade network: Facebook’s relationship with wildlife traders in Vietnam. WildAct, Hanoi, Vietnam. 55	
617.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Polishing off the ivory: Surveys of Thailand’s Ivory Market.</b> 2014. Naomi Doak. A TRAFFIC report. ....	56
618.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Control of Elephant Ivory Trade in Thailand: Under the New Legal Framework</b> .....	57
619.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), TIME FOR ACTION: End the criminality and corruption fueling wildlife crime,</b> 2016 .....	58
620.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Pangolin</i> )	<b>Global Ecology and Conservation, Where did all the pangolins go?</b> International CITES trade in pangolin species, October 2016.....	58
621.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Wildlife Value Orientations in Thailand: Preliminary Findings,</b> 2007.....	59

622.	<b>THAILAND</b> (Elephant)	Laohachaiboon, S. (2010). <b>Conservation for Whom? Elephant Conservation and Elephant Conservationists in Thailand.</b> Southeast Asian Studies, 48, 74-95. ....	59
623.	<b>THAILAND</b> (Elephant)	Stiles, D. (2009). <b>The Elephant and Ivory Trade in Thailand.</b> TRAFFIC Southeast Asia. Petaling Jaya, Selangor, Malaysia. ....	59
624.	<b>THAILAND</b> (Elephant)	<b>Still in Business: The Ivory Trade in Asia, Seven Years after the CITES Ban.</b> TRAFFIC International, Cambridge, UK. ....	60
625.	<b>THAILAND</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Understand Thai consumers.</b> ....	60
626.	<b>THAILAND</b> (Elephant)	<b>Market surveys find disturbing increase in Thai ivory market.</b> 2014. TRAFFIC in In Asia. ....	61
627.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>World wildlife crime report: Trafficking in protected species.</b> 2016. UNODC. ....	62
628.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Briefing paper: Changing consumer behavior: A long-term solution to the global poaching crisis.</b> TRAFFIC & WWF. May 2014. ....	65
629.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Mid-term performance evaluation of Asia’s regional response to endangered species trafficking (ARREST) program. Evaluation report.</b> October 2013. By USAID. ....	66
630.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Influencing human behaviour: An underutilised tool for biodiversity management.</b> 2013. By Diogo Verissimo. ....	67
631.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Fighting illicit wildlife trafficking. A consultation with governments conducted by Dalberg.</b> December 2012. By WWF International/Dalberg. ....	69
632.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Creative experts’ meeting on messaging to reduce consumer demand for tigers and other endangered wildlife species in Vietnam and China. A meeting report.</b> November 2011. TRAFFIC and WWF. ....	70
633.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>What’s driving the wildlife trade? A review of expert opinion on economic and social drivers of the wildlife trade and trade control efforts in Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, and Vietnam.</b> October 2008. By TRAFFIC. ....	71
634.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> (Multi-species)	<b>Wildlife crime tech challenge – Issue 3: Consumer demand.</b> Year?. Funded by? ....	72



635.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>EDITORIAL Wildlife trade in Asia: start with the consumer.</b> Year?. Funded?.....	74
636.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Tiger</i> )	<b>Ending Trade in Tiger Parts and Products.</b> A poster by EIA. ....	74
637.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>The disappearing act. The illicit trade in wildlife in Asia.</b> June 2011. By Vanda Felbab-Brown, Foreign Policy at Brookings.....	75
638.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Vanishing point: A study of cross-border wildlife trade between Lao PDR and Vietnam.</b> October 1999. WWF.....	75
639.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Exploring cultural drivers for wildlife trade via an ethnoprimateological approach: a case study of slender and slow lorises</b> (Loris and Nycticebus) in South and Southeast Asia, 2010.....	76
640.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Conspicuous Consumption and Wildlife.</b> .....	77
641.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Analysis of demand-side reduction initiatives.</b> August 2014. Commissioned by Stop Ivory for the EPI & The Royal Foundation. ....	77
642.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Reducing desire for ivory.</b> 2016. By Dr. Renee Lertzman and Karen Baragona .....	80
643.	<b>THAILAND</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>Wildlife on a tightrope. An overview of wild animals in entertainment in Thailand.</b> 2016. World Animal Protection.....	80
644.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Multi-species</i> )	<b>The Global Threat to Biodiversity from Wildlife Trade - a Major 21st Century Challenge.</b> 2016. The Oxford Martin School's Programme on the Illegal Wildlife Trade.....	81
645.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Rhino</i> )	<b>Assessment of rhino horn as a traditional medicine.</b> A report prepared for the CITES Secretariat by Kristin Nowell on behalf of TRAFFIC. April 2012 .....	82
646.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> ( <i>Elephant</i> )	<b>Ivory Crush.</b> WCS. ....	83

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
101. Ivory Demand Analysis and Social Marketing Strategy. February 2016. Report by China Market Research Group funded by IFAW.	<b>CHINA</b> Shanghai and Beijing  To develop an effective strategy for a social marketing campaign aimed at reducing demand for ivory in China	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In-depth interviews with 30 ivory buyers and 70 potential ivory buyers</li> <li>▪ Surveys with 80 ivory buyers and 320 potential ivory buyers</li> <li>▪ 1:1 male/female</li> <li>▪ 20% aged 20-24; 40% 25-34; 40% 35-50</li> <li>▪ Income of at least 8000 RMB/month</li> <li>▪ 12 interviews with store managers</li> <li>▪ 40 mini-interviews with non-ivory buyers on reasons for not buying ivory</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Gift Buyers are mostly 30-50 years old, male, moderately affluent, buying for friends (70%) and business (40%) for recipient's status and wealth, but also consider other materials e.g. jade, agate, rosewood as substitutes. Most some are illegal but willing to buy from legal, authorized stores.</li> <li>▪ Home Decor Buyers: Both sexes, moderately affluent. Pay more per item than other buyers. 1/3 are collectors. To show taste to connect with cultural heritage. Not worried about legal issues (41% buy from unauthorized shops). Animal conservation is important but don't see they are related to it. Won't buy if friends disapprove.</li> <li>▪ Jewelry Buyers: younger, female, and less affluent than other buyers, buying less often (1-2 in life). To show unique taste, but worried about being judged on what they wear. Concerned about animal cruelty but don't think they are related. Most unaware it is illegal. Those aware think it isn't enforced enough to be a serious risk.</li> <li>▪ Most buyers notice signs and flyers in ivory stores, also billboards, subway signs, and video ads in elevators and taxis. 35+ year-olds watch TV, 20s and 30s watch TV content online including pre-roll video ads. Buyers are likely to read and pass on materials about ivory via WeChat (99% respondents use daily).</li> <li>▪ Messages making them think must strike emotions and give sense of intelligence, feelings, and suffering of elephants. Most prefer color ads with elephant's close-up in motion. Strong messages are from people in the arts, athletics, and business known for supporting charity (Ning Zetao, Sun Li, Wang Sicong, Chai Jing).</li> <li>▪ Ads using text or stats e.g. dying rate don't make strong impact and make the issue abstract and far away from their lives. "When the buying ends, the killing does too" is easy to remember, but not clear how buying leads to killing.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Raising legal issue awareness is key.</li> <li>▪ Stress Xi's banning and its effect on its value</li> <li>▪ Even small amounts lead to trouble</li> <li>▪ Official WeChat account and stickers</li> <li>▪ Show elephants' intelligence, emotions and family bonds, sensitivity</li> <li>▪ Promote zoos and museums visits</li> <li>▪ Connect buying ivory to killing elephants</li> <li>▪ Short films about history of humans and elephants and conservation efforts</li> <li>▪ A world without elephants</li> <li>▪ Images of cruelty</li> <li>▪ Promote substitutes</li> <li>▪ Associate owning ivory with corruption and preserving wildlife as noble</li> <li>▪ Stories on changing behavior can impact society and planet</li> <li>▪ Stories on people devoting to protection in Africa</li> </ul>
102. iThink Campaign - PSA Impact Evaluation on Ivory Trade in China. October 2015. By Rapid Asia for IFAW China.	<b>CHINA</b>  Tier 1, 2 & 3 Cities in China  To measure attractiveness of wildlife products and	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ KAP Score</li> <li>▪ Target group: Ivory buyers/non-buyers, aged 18 up to 64 years</li> <li>▪ Data collection: Online panel</li> <li>▪ Sample: 500+</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>IVORY PURCHASING BEHAVIOR</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ivory purchase declined, but still high at end line (33%) and widespread. Demographic profile of ivory buyers are varied, i.e. male-female, young-old. A high proportion is female in management with higher income.</li> <li>▪ There has been a decline in ivory purchasing behavior, those who claimed they bought ivory in the past 12 months. Down from 44% in 2013 to 33% in 2015. Campaigning against ivory consumption and the recent auction ban in China are likely to have contributed</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The decline in demand for ivory is a good sign that current communication efforts are working but the weakening economic conditions in China could also have contributed to this decline. Either way, it is a</li> </ul>

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>the motivation behind buying them;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To determine to what extent people are aware of illegal wildlife trade and source of awareness;</li> <li>▪ To develop a profile of buyers of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To measure effective reach of the iThink campaign;</li> <li>▪ To measure knowledge about laws and visibility of law enforcement;</li> <li>▪ To measure knowledge of the negative effects of the illegal wildlife trade;</li> <li>▪ To measure attitudes in relation to consumption of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To determine current and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 50/50 split between male and female</li> <li>▪ Sample Weighting: between 2013 (baseline) and 2015</li> <li>▪ Questionnaire - Screening questions based on target respondent criteria</li> <li>- Ownership and purchase behavior for ivory products</li> <li>- Exposure and perception about law enforcement</li> <li>- Exposure to the IFAW PSA and media source</li> <li>▪ Exposure to two PSAs via online streaming: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Evaluation of communication objectives</li> <li>- KAP Score questions looking at Knowledge, Attitude and Practice in relation to buying ivory</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>to this decline. However, it is worth noting that with the exception of cars, purchasing behavior for other luxury goods have also declined. Hence, the slowing economy in China may also be a contributing factor</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ However, purchase of other luxury goods also declined. The economy may be a factor.</li> <li>▪ Main motivation is 1) decoration and 2) jewelry.</li> <li>▪ Most purchases are done in retail stores.</li> <li>▪ Reasons for not buying in the future included feeling it is 'wrong as elephants are killed' and 'elephants being endangered'.</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ LAW ENFORCEMENT <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 65% exposed to some kind of law enforcement action against ivory trade, most from TV and social media.</li> <li>▪ Those exposed to law enforcement perceived the risk of getting caught as reasonably high.</li> <li>▪ Consumers were less aware of how to buy ivory legally in China at end line.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ EVALUATION OF PSA EXECUTION <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 62% saw the PSAs.</li> <li>▪ Not all the PSAs performed equally well. PSA B and C had the highest level of processing.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ FUTURE MESSAGE DEVELOPMENT <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Opportunity to strengthen knowledge. A large proportion of people still don't have full knowledge about the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ That hundreds of thousands of elephants have died as a result of the ivory trade. The extent of the killing could potentially be highlighted as it could be a deterrent for many potential buyers.</li> <li>○ The demand for ivory stimulate illegal ivory trade. Ivory demand reduction strategies could be developed around promoting alternative products or creating belief about buying ivory may be bad for luck.</li> <li>○ Ivory comes from dead elephants. This message can be further built on because it has worked well in the past and many consumers still don't know that ivory comes from dead elephants think the tusks fall off and can be harvested naturally</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>good opportunity to continue to reinforce not to buy ivory</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mobile penetration is very high and most consumers use it regularly. A key message delivery channel for the iThink campaign is through internet and social media. With relatively high reach, internet portal in particular had the highest reach of all channels, the adopted strategy seems to work well in terms of reaching consumers and should continue</li> <li>▪ Awareness and knowledge about the legal licensing system for ivory has declined significantly over the past two years. The shift toward more buying over the internet also strengthens this argument and it seems the licensing system is failing to achieve its objective. This evidence can potentially be used as a counter argument and to show the government that a legal licensing system does not help to raise the demand for legal ivory but only contributes to confusing consumers and raising the demand for illegal ivory as well</li> <li>▪ Efforts to persuade the government to put in more effort into stopping ivory</li> </ul>

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>future consumer buying behavior for wildlife products;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To determine how well the campaign has met its communication objectives;</li> <li>▪ To measure campaign impact and benchmark to past, similar initiatives as well as looking at the difference law enforcement can make;</li> <li>▪ To gain an insight into issues that may be important to incorporate into future campaigns and make specific recommendations.</li> </ul>	<p>future purchasing of ivory products</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Media penetration and consumption</li> <li>- Demographics</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ With respect to attitudes, the strongest positive attitude is that Chinese are not prejudice and don't accept that elephants should be killed to supply ivory. The PSA has helped to reinforce some of the positive attitudes including not being oblivious, ignorant and apathetic. Hence, the PSA does a good job of stirring the emotions of potential buyers and means it should work well for prevention purposes. Not surprisingly, positive attitudes were found to be more pronounced amongst non-buyers of ivory</li> <li>▪ In terms of behavior, the PSA has helped to make people aware and start thinking about doing the right thing. The shift in behavioral intent is still significant and evident amongst both buyers and non-buyers of ivory</li> <li>▪ PSA IMPACT               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The KAP Score framework was incorporated into the analysis to measure impact and to have the ability to benchmark the overall result</li> <li>▪ The KAP Index for the 2013 baseline was 52 prior to exposure. In the 2015 exposure group (those who had seen the PSA) the KAP Index was significantly higher at 69. Based on over 21,000 interviews with general public in 21 countries, the average shift for similar interventions has been 17 points on the KAP Index. The iThink campaign had an equal result with an overall 17-point increase in the KAP Index</li> <li>▪ When comparing the impact across different target audience segments, it was found that significant impact was achieved across most demographic segments but the shift would generally be higher if the segment had a lower KAP Index to start with. In other words, the PSA has delivered a very clear message and managed to strengthen the mind-sets of people up to a consistently high level. The KAP Index was on average higher for those who have not bought ivory in the past 12 months (75) compared to those who did buy (58). This finding confirms and validates that the KAP Index is a good proxy for behavior change</li> <li>▪ Some of the PSAs had strong impact on males or females and some were found to work better with younger or older people. PSA A and H were found to have more impact on older males and PSA G towards older females. PSA D and I had more impact on younger females. PSA B and F work for both older males and</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>trade needs to continue and consumers also look to the government to serve as a role model</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Since some PSAs work better for niche audiences it will be important to review the media plan and use channels that will maximize the impact from each PSA</li> <li>▪ Since the campaign has only been aired for 6 months it may be useful to conduct an impact measure further down the track, especially if adjustments are made to the media plan</li> </ul>

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			females and PSA C and E work well across all age and sex groups. Based on these results, PSA B, C, E and F can be used as mass strategy while the rest PSA should be focused on niche target groups	
103. Ivory: Inside the Mind of the Chinese Consumer. September 2015. Report by The Nature Conservancy and APCO Insight.	CHINA Beijing, Shanghai, and Guangzhou  To identify audience and messages for a DR campaign	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 5 FGDs</li> <li>▪ 11 IDIs</li> <li>▪ Random sample web survey with 1,000 18+ adults</li> <li>▪ Minimum income 5000 RMB/month</li> <li>▪ Plus message assessment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 3 groups identified: 1) Rejecters, 2) Persuadable (target), 3) Unconvinced Likely Buyers (ULB)</li> <li>▪ Elephants are top-of-mind associations among all segments, but Precious is distinct among ULB</li> <li>▪ News about ivory is saturating the air waves – brutality faced by elephants a top mention</li> <li>▪ 27% likely to buy ivory in the future</li> <li>▪ Most likely buyers: high &amp; low middle income, Shanghai/Guangzhou, luxury buyers, purchased before, confident recent purchase was legal</li> <li>▪ Persuadable: Both sexes, young (18-40), upper middle income, has children, in Guangzhou, use social media, 1 in 4 purchased before</li> <li>▪ NGOs, journalists, experts/scientists, family and friends can persuade the Persuadable</li> <li>▪ Belief of ivory as a longstanding tradition and investment are drivers of purchasing</li> <li>▪ Messages having impact on decreasing demand: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Important to reduce gov't corruption and giving ivory as gifts to officials encourage corruption</li> <li>- Gov't will gradually ban the buying and selling.</li> <li>- Elephants are killed for ivory in the illegal trade. Most supply in China is illegal and it's difficult to differentiate between legal and illegal ivory.</li> <li>- Saving elephants is protecting environment and ecosystem balance.</li> <li>- Tusks don't fall out on their own like teeth. People kill elephants to remove tusks.</li> <li>- Illegal ivory trade will make African elephants extinct in 20 years.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Public policy and demand reduction strategies interdependent</li> <li>▪ Surround sound effect: Rational and emotional messages targeted at “persuadable” via online channels</li> <li>▪ NGO community needs to play an educational role to amplify ban</li> </ul>
104. Ivory Demand in China. 2014. Horizon key Research, WildAid, Save The Elephants, and African Wildlife Foundation.	CHINA Beijing, Shanghai and Guangzhou  To assess awareness, attitudes and behavior on	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Baseline interviews conducted in November 2012 with residents in 3 cities: Beijing, Shanghai, and Guangzhou</li> <li>▪ N=961; End line</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 70% aware of elephant poaching problem compared to 46% in 2012</li> <li>▪ Increase awareness on how ivory is obtained (48% from 33%)</li> <li>▪ Beijing more aware of ivory from poached elephants (53% from 25%)</li> <li>▪ 49% can't tell the difference between illegal and legal ivory. Improved in knowledge that they should ask for a certificate.</li> <li>▪ 56.1% saw WildAid PSAs featuring Yao Ming or Li Bingbing and 90.1% of those said they wouldn't buy ivory after viewing the PSAs.</li> <li>▪ 52.9% cited graphic and cruel images of poached elephants as the most effective way to persuade consumers to end consumption.</li> </ul>	N/A

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	consumption crisis, and on the campaign	<p>interviews replicated in October 2014 N= 935 urban residents in the same 3 cities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Samples weighed according to the Yearbook of Statistics of Chinese Cities in 2013; Urban residents who have lived in Beijing, Shanghai, or Guangzhou for over one year</li> <li>▪ Age: 18 years old and older where 18 -35-year-old accounted for 40.2%, 36 -50-year-old accounted for 37.8%, and those above 50 years old accounted for 22%.</li> <li>▪ In-person, questionnaire.</li> <li>▪ Income: Monthly income between RMB 0 to over RMB 10001.</li> </ul>		
105. Ivory Demand in China. 2012. Report by Horizon Key	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Beijing, Shanghai and Guangzhou</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Survey with 961 urban residents</li> <li>▪ IDIs and FGDs with media</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 50% don't think elephant poaching is common.</li> <li>▪ 33% believe elephants are poached for tusks.</li> <li>▪ Over 45% could not distinguish legal ivory from ivory obtained illegally.</li> </ul>	N/A

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
Research Consultancy Group funded by WildAid.	To assess awareness of elephant conservation, consumption of ivory in China, and what might be done to deter consumption and poaching.	professionals, high-ranking government officials, customs officials, and a high-income group with annual household income above 2 million RMB.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Beijing residents are least informed of poaching and ivory trade compared to the other cities.</li> <li>▪ 94% agreed “Chinese gov’t should impose a ban on ivory trade to help stop poaching in Africa.”</li> <li>▪ 98.2% in Beijing believe the gov’t should impose a ban on ivory, including domestic trade.</li> <li>▪ 99.2% of all agree that “we should ensure elephants exist on earth.”</li> <li>▪ FGD: Less concerned about certification of cheaper products than large and costly pieces. Exhibit trust for large-scale shopping malls.</li> <li>▪ FGD: Circles and acquaintances play important roles in the Chinese ivory trade.</li> <li>▪ FGD: Major reason: private gift to friends, loved ones, and peers.</li> <li>▪ FGD: Still consumed ivory without asking for certification.</li> </ul>	
106. Report on Chinese Residents' Ivory Consumption and Elephant Conservation Awareness. June 2007. Report by Horizon key. Funded by IFAW.	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Beijing, Shanghai, Nanjing, Guangzhou</p> <p>To understand public consumer’s demand and behavior on ivory products and their willingness to protect wild elephants</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Profile: Age 18-65</li> <li>▪ Sample size: 975 from mall intercept survey (no need to use ivory products) and 278 quota sampling (must have used ivory products)</li> <li>▪ Systematic random sampling using time interval close to arts and antique shops</li> <li>▪ Face-to-face questionnaire interviews</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 48% didn’t want to buy.</li> <li>▪ 14.5% of urban residents in the survey have ivory products.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 64.5% purchased one product mostly from antique and crafts stores. Price is concerned most. Illegal status is not a concern.</li> <li>- Motives: beauty, novelty, collection, investment</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ 40% planned to buy.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 43% want African elephant products; 15% want Asian elephant product.</li> <li>- Motive is that products are beautiful, natural, embodying grade, and precious.</li> <li>- Main reasons of not purchasing yet are elephant conservation and high price.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ ≈60% don’t accept substitutes. Most think they are not as rare. They are acceptable if prices are low and craftsmanship is the same.</li> <li>▪ &gt; 50% not sure about the wild elephant number.</li> <li>▪ 59% know world’s wild elephant distribution.</li> <li>▪ 0.5% know what elephants have ivories.</li> <li>▪ 50% perceived products currently available in the market are wild elephants prayed.</li> <li>▪ 60% perceived wild elephants are decreasing.</li> <li>▪ 90% aware of dangers faced by wild elephants</li> <li>▪ 98% think it’s important to protect elephants.</li> <li>▪ Most protect elephants for animal protection, but some for utilization.</li> <li>▪ 69% attribute the rising price of carved ivory to the “increasing scarcity of raw materials”.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Urban residents highly demand ivory. The majority are well-educated and white-collars with high income.</li> <li>▪ It is necessary to guide people to buy traditional carving crafts made of other materials to reduce ivory demand.</li> <li>▪ Ivory certification system still has limited effect in regulating the consumer market.</li> <li>▪ Respondents show strong willingness to protect elephants, but they don’t have good knowledge on this.</li> <li>▪ The government’s market regulation and punishment of illegal acts remain more important.</li> </ul>

## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
107. Reducing Demand for Ivory: An International Study. August 2015. Report by National Geographic.	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b></p> <p>China, Philippines, Thailand, United States, Vietnam</p> <p>To provide insight into the dynamics of demand for ivory and understand which consumer attitudes and opinions could be changed to reduce demand</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 45 IDIs</li> <li>▪ 10 FGDs</li> <li>▪ ≈ 1,000 in each country with adults 18+.</li> <li>▪ Online surveys in China, US and Philippines</li> <li>▪ In person surveys in Vietnam and Thailand</li> <li>▪ Online sampling with a population sample weighted on demographics.</li> <li>▪ For offline, sample set per census data.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 60% think the scarcity is from decreasing elephants, higher than from the illegal status.</li> <li>▪ 5 groups identified. The most important group, “Likely Buyers,” is 22% across countries. 1/3 in China and Philippines. 15% in the rest. Having strongest intent to buy, they fuel the demand.</li> <li>▪ Motivators of purchase intent: Likely Buyers describe themselves as fashionable, social and religious. Buy products that convey financial and social status. The strongest intent to buy is its suitability for gifting. The happiness and status it imparts upon both giver and receiver.</li> <li>▪ Awareness of elephant threats is generally high among Likely Buyers, not differ overall.</li> <li>▪ Support for gov’t action to ban or the trade is widespread in all countries, even among owners and likely buyers.</li> <li>▪ 3 key factors driving increased support for regulation: 1) animal rights and decline in elephant number; 2) illegality of the trade; 3) consumer desire to make ethical purchases.</li> <li>▪ While support for regulation is high, it is not strongly linked to individual purchase intent. Advocacy work may strengthen support for government action, but may not alter social values that fuel demand. DR efforts require both top-down and bottom-up strategies.</li> <li>▪ Environmental NGOs, scientists/ academics and family and friends are the most trusted sources of information on ivory issues.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Messaging should degrade ivory’s association with status, being fashionable and being an ideal gift. As it becomes less socially acceptable, its suitability as a gift could diminish.</li> <li>▪ Rational messaging that heightens doubt that ivory is a good investment or a smart purchase.</li> <li>▪ Promote awareness of the illegalities, and foster values e.g. animal rights, ethical purchasing.</li> </ul>
108. Ivory Consumption Study: Qualitative Phase Advisory Board Summary. 2014. Report by National Geographic.	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b></p> <p>China, Vietnam, Philippines, and Thailand</p> <p>To obtain key insights on ivory use and use the information to design the quantitative research</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 45 in-depth interviews and 10 focus groups</li> <li>▪ Current owners and buyers</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Some owners attach a great deal of spiritual or symbolic value to ivory (hardcore). Some express ivory is simply “nice” (swing); they are more likely swayed by messaging to curb demand.</li> <li>▪ Ethical statements (cruelty associated) seen to be credible and elicit uneasiness especially among females and young people, but buyers especially hardcore provided reasons detaching from ivory purchase consequences including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lack of personal responsibility or involvement (too far off, inevitable, seller’s responsibility)</li> <li>- Ivory is procured without killing.</li> <li>- Consumer demand is not the root cause.</li> <li>- Lack of empathy for animal life</li> <li>- Disbelief that risk of extinction is real</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Legal statements: Sense that consumers cannot be trusted to reduce demand and they need to be forced to do so by governments. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Sense that “if it is legal”, any who can afford it should be able to.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ethical: Reduce the power of spiritual values, luck and health by linking to how it is procured – tarnishing its “purity”. Buying at the expense of life seen to bring “bad karma”.</li> <li>▪ Make people think twice before buying for those know less well or don’t value abstract benefits of ivory (younger).</li> <li>▪ Hardcore group is difficult to sway. May be motivated by scarcity to get more.</li> </ul>



## ELEPHANT

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Little desire to understand the legalities and assume that it is the seller's responsibility</li> <li>- All "legal" ivory is obtained through "humane" means i.e. elephants are not killed.</li> <li>- Many believe full or large pieces problematic</li> <li>- Some say will buy whether it is legal or not.</li> <li>▪ Image statements: Historic, symbolic, spiritual hard to replace. Negative traits are minor; colors/cracks with age can be attractive.</li> <li>- Some female and youth: Ivory is not fashionable for the young.</li> <li>- Many disagreed on ivory as showy items.</li> <li>- Ivory seen as peace, luck, health to recipients; many disagreed on giver's ignorant image</li> <li>- Investment: Concerns about the true value and about fake pieces.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ "Swing" group should be targeted.</li> <li>▪ Personalize the consequences due to the lack of direct personal effect.</li> <li>▪ 3 key themes – ethical, legal, and image.</li> <li>▪ Source reputation, purity of motive, and credibility in the form of knowledge credentials, have potential to gain audience trust.</li> </ul>

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
<p>201. Rhino Rage: What is Driving Illegal Consumer Demand for Rhino Horn. 2016. Survey report by Horizon Key funded by NRDC.</p>	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, Kunming, and Harbin</p> <p>1) To collect market data used to draw demand curves to answer whether does current supply meets current demand 2) To collect the profiles of potential users to help inform demand reduction strategies</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Sample size: 2,121 (systematic random sampling)</li> <li>▪ “Stated preference technique” questionnaire (for illegal products)</li> <li>▪ I-on-I situ interviews</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Demands: Medicine and luxury goods with regional differences.</li> <li>▪ Illegal status and conservation awareness reduce demand.</li> <li>▪ 48.3 % of rhino horn users are driven wholly or mostly by medicinal belief</li> <li>▪ 21.3 % of rhino horn users are driven by both luxury and medicinal reasons</li> <li>▪ Potential Buyers are young (aged 18-45), well-educated males and from the growing middle and upper classes. They are well-educated. The main reason for buying horn as a luxury good is to “give as a gift” to friends, family members, associates because it is “unique”. To them, it is “unique”, “rare” or associated with prestige, that it is traditional and a sign of success</li> <li>▪ Buyers are older (aged 36-45), well-educated and wealthy people. They favor Chinese medicine for rheumatism, and erectile dysfunction while they choose Western medicine to treat common conditions such as fever, rash, hangover. They believe that Chinese medicine has fewer side effects in the Chinese medicine.</li> <li>▪ Kunming and Harbin: most aware of horn uses, had lowest knowledge of law on horn trade, and most likely know someone who bought.</li> <li>▪ Kunming: 69% know horn as medicine; 81% say horn is important for traditional Chinese medicine.</li> <li>▪ Beijing and Shanghai: least aware of horn uses and good knowledge of law on rhino horn. Least likely to know someone who bought.</li> <li>▪ Nearly half knew horn is used as medicine of which half said for fever.</li> <li>▪ Half said horn is important in Chinese traditional medicine.</li> <li>▪ Of those knowing horn medicinal use, 44% aware of alternatives, 41% didn’t know, 16% said there is no alternative.</li> <li>▪ Between horn and herbal remedies, most chose herbal remedy.</li> <li>▪ Price rise reduced buyer numbers for both medicine and luxury.</li> <li>▪ Many more know someone who bought for medicine than luxury.</li> <li>▪ Potential luxury buyers: young, well-educated males</li> <li>▪ Main reason for buying horn as luxury is as a gift as it’s unique</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Tailor regional differences: Educate 2<sup>nd</sup> tier cities on illegal trade; focus herbal alternative in 1<sup>st</sup> tier cities.</li> <li>▪ Medicine: Say effective alternatives available (women as target)</li> <li>▪ Luxury: combined strategy to change idea horn is desirable (value &amp; unique) e.g. promote conservation and gift substitutes</li> <li>▪ Research more whether: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Current supply meet current demand?</li> <li>- Buying change with legal/ synthetic horn in market?</li> <li>- Limitations of partial equilibrium model supporting the current intl legal trade argument yield doubt for policy makers? What models should be considered?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 66% of those considering buying horn said because it is rare.</li> <li>▪ 1/4 thought it was legal to buy horn or said they didn't know.</li> <li>▪ Most believed risk of arrest for buying was average or low.</li> <li>▪ Rhino population had little/no effect on purchasing as a luxury good.</li> </ul>	
202. Rhino Horn Demand. 2012. Report by Horizon Key Research funded by WildAid and African Wildlife Foundation.	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou</p> <p>To understand pre-existing attitudes, knowledge, and perceptions on rhino horn and its trade</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ IDIs and FGDs (didn't mention the number)</li> <li>▪ Participants: Media, high-ranking government officials, customs officials, a 'high-income group' with annual income above 2 million RMB.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ More than half didn't know the rhino horn material. Upon learning its material, perceptions around its medicinal value seemed to change.</li> <li>▪ Respondents were wary of rumored claims in Vietnam that rhino horn can cure cancer.</li> <li>▪ To the Chinese public, there is no doubt that rhinos are endangered wild animals under protection. All interviewees believed that although no wild rhinos live within the territory of China, the Chinese government should ensure the survival of rhinos and increase punishment for offenders.</li> </ul>	▪ N/A
203. Rhino Horn Demand. 2014. Report by Horizon Key Research funded by WildAid and African Wildlife Foundation.	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou</p> <p>To assess any change in awareness, attitudes and behavior regarding rhino horn consumption and the rhino poaching crisis, and to ascertain the reach of campaign messages in the same three cities</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Baseline interviews conducted in November 2012 with residents in 3 cities: Beijing, Shanghai, and Guangzhou N=963; End line interviews replicated in October 2014 N= 935 urban residents in the same 3 cities</li> <li>▪ Samples weighed according to the Yearbook of Statistics of Chinese Cities in</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 50% aware of wild rhino poaching problem compared to 33% in 2012</li> <li>▪ Nearly half, 49.4% of participants in 2012 and 46.3% in 2014, believed that rhino horn could be legally purchased from official stores</li> <li>▪ 2014 survey showed a 23.5% reduction in the belief that rhino horn has a medicinal effect, falling from 58.2% in 2012 to 44.5% in 2014.</li> <li>▪ Of participants who do not buy rhino horn, 95% said the Chinese government should take stricter action to prevent the use of rhino horns. Even 87% (compared to 72% in 2012) of those who purchase rhino horns agreed with stricter restrictions</li> <li>▪ More than 90% of interviewees think poaching poses a serious (or very serious) threat to rhinos, compared to 74% in 2012. The increase was most pronounced in Beijing, where awareness of the seriousness of poaching grew from 6.1% to 54%.</li> <li>▪ More than 92% (90% in 2012) of all respondents believe that trade in rhino horn is illegal. In 1977, China signed CITES and banned all international trade in rhino horns. In 1993, the State Council banned rhino horn sales within China</li> <li>▪ 40% of participants interviewed in 2014 had watched PSAs featuring ambassadors Yao Ming or Jackie Chan and 90.9% of those said they wouldn't buy rhino horn after viewing the PSAs</li> </ul>	▪ N/A

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
		<p>2013; Urban residents who have lived in Beijing, Shanghai, or Guangzhou for over one year</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Age: 18 years old and older where 18 -35-year-old accounted for 40.2%, 36 -50-year-old accounted for 37.8%, and those above 50 years old accounted for 22%.</li> <li>▪ In-person, questionnaire.</li> <li>▪ Income: Monthly income between RMB 0 to over RMB 10001.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In 2014, 44.4% of residents cited seeing graphic images of poached rhinos as the most effective way to persuade consumers to end their ivory consumption</li> </ul>	
<p>204. Consumer Research on Rhino Horn Usage in Vietnam. April 2013. Ipsos. TRAFFIC</p>	<p><b>Vietnam</b>            HCMC, Hanoi (Vietnam)            To understand and measure the Awareness, Usage &amp; Attitude of the Vietnamese public (including users/ buyers/ non users and potential users/</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Qualitative followed by quantitative</li> <li>▪ Qualitative in HCMC and Hanoi, 34 IDI with Buyers of rhino horn, Users of rhino horn, Non users / buyer but aware of rhino horn , Traditional medicine / herbal expert</li> </ul>	<p>Key insights:            Rhino horn awareness and perceived benefits:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ RH has high awareness and demand</li> <li>▪ It is perceived as rare, valuable and good for health treatment/support (cancer treatment, strengthened bone and joints, hangover treatment) especially in Hanoi</li> <li>▪ Current usage is low (4%) but with high risk of increase (60% of users intend to repurchase and 16% non-users intend to buy)</li> </ul> <p>→ Reduce demand of usage/purchase intender, reduce repurchase, target Hanoi but quite challenging as they are facing more social pressure: a need to give “gift” to business relations and stronger belief in the benefit of RH</p> <p>Buyers/Users/Intenders profile:</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	buyers) towards rhino horn	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Quantitative with structured questionnaire: 56 buyers and users in HCMC and 54 in Hanoi; total sample (random): 300 in each city</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Buyers: middle-aged or older women, wealthy (business owners) and well-educated people, buying for parents.</li> <li>▪ Users: tend to be older wealthy people               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Both buyers and users tend to be more concerned about health and encounter more problems e.g. bone and joint issues, stroke, cancers.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Intenders: health conscious, wanting to maintain/enhance good health to continue enjoying their wealthy life → Target wealthy women of middle aged or above. Break the status of wealthy, create the symbol of wealth that links more to educated behavior and humanity towards wildlife animals</li> <li>▪ 4% consume rhino horn. There is high risk of increase since 60% of users intend to re-purchase and 16% non-users intend to buy. PLEASE NOTE MY COMMENTS.</li> <li>▪ Buyers of rhino horn are influential, well educated, successful and powerful individuals. They tend to be men over 40 years old. They form a social network of important individuals among whom it is crucial to maintain good relationships.</li> <li>▪ Rhino horn sometimes is bought for the sole purpose of being gifted to others: to family members, business associates, or people in the position of authority.</li> <li>▪ They believe that owning rhino horn or being able to give it as gifts affirms their social status and strengthens their bonds with peers within their social network. There is a strong sense of trust among their social network and they are aware that they are engaging in an illegal activity.</li> <li>▪ Status-driven users of rhino horn are generally health conscious. While their main reason for purchasing rhino horn is to affirm their social status, they also believe in its health benefits (as a detoxification for the body and cure for hangover and serious illnesses). They feel that keeping rhino horn at home ensures the well-being of their families.</li> </ul>	

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Although they know that the animals are killed for rhino horn, they feel disconnected from this. Others feel that even if the species were to be lost forever, they personally will not be affected.</li> </ul>	
<p>205. Demand for rhino horns in Vietnam decreases because of Humane Society International and Vietnam CITES Management Authority Partnership Campaign, poll says. October 2014. By Vietnam rhino horn demand reduction campaign.</p>	<p><b>Viet Nam</b> Hanoi, HCMC, Nha Trang, Da Nang, Can Tho, Hai Phong</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Public opinion polls conducted by Nielsen before and after the campaign to measure impact:</li> <li>▪ Survey of 1000 people in 6 major municipalities (Ha Noi, Ho Chi Minh, Nha Trang, Da Nang, Can Tho, Hai Phong) in August 2014.</li> <li>▪ 30 minute interviews (door-to-door, face-to-face using pen and paper)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Key results included:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Only 2.6% of people in Vietnam continue to buy and use rhino horn, a decrease of 38% since the campaign started in August 2013</li> <li>▪ 77% decline in people in Hanoi buying and using rhino horn, down from 4.5% to 1%</li> <li>▪ 25% decrease in the number of people in Vietnam who think using rhino horn has medical value</li> <li>▪ Only 38% of the national population and 21% of people in Hanoi city continue to think that rhino horn has medical value, a 51% and 53% decrease respectively from last year</li> <li>▪ Of those who think rhino horn can treat diseases, most believe it can treat cancer (60%) and rheumatism (40%)</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Key messages included:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ It is illegal to buy, sell or transport rhino horn in Viet Nam, punishable by up to 7 years imprisonment and a large fine</li> <li>▪ Rhino horns are made of keratin, the same substance as human fingernails</li> <li>▪ Rhino horn is not effective at treating any human disease, including cancer</li> <li>▪ Buying rhino horn is a waste of money</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ The campaign reached out to:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 800,000-member Hanoi Women’s Association. Workshops were held with Association leaders and leaders of nine districts, 140 wards and 1,937 communities within the Association. In total 219,000 women community leaders were directly trained.</li> <li>▪ Hanoi Association of Entrepreneur Women, the internet company Onnet, and Doanh Nghiep (serving the Viet Nam Small and Medium Enterprises Association)</li> <li>▪ University students: 6 universities in Hanoi (800 students). A national contest with 14 entries (?) from 10 universities received.</li> <li>▪ Children: A book for primary-aged school children was prepared, entitled “I’m A Little Rhino”. The 16page book, with colorful drawings and child-friendly text in Vietnamese and English, was</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## RHINO

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			distributed to approximately 40,000 children in Hanoi. The books were distributed on World Rhino Day and Vietnam's mid-Autumn festival	

## TIGER

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
<p>301. Attitudes Toward Consumption and Conservation of Tigers in China. April 2008. Academic article by many affiliations e.g. NFWF, Oxford University, IFAW, WWF. Survey by Horizon Key.</p>	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Kunming, Guilin, Harbin, Chengdu, Guangzhou, Shanghai, and Beijing</p> <p>To analyze consequences of lifting the ban on trade in farmed tiger products</p> <p>To assess urban tiger consumption, knowledge of trade issues and attitudes towards tiger conservation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Face-to-face interviews</li> <li>▪ Systematic random sampling</li> <li>▪ 18+ years old</li> <li>▪ 1,880 residents from 6 cities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 43% consumed tiger products. Of these, 71% preferred wild over farmed products. 78% said wild tigers are more valuable medicinally.</li> <li>▪ Two predominant products: Tiger bone plasters for aches and pain (38%) and tiger bone wine (6.4%).</li> <li>▪ Of those using bone plasters, 60% used in the last two years.</li> <li>▪ Of those consuming wine, 52% consumed in the last two years.</li> <li>▪ Both plasters and wine were used to treat bone and joint illnesses, but wine was also taken as a tonic to increase sexual capacity.</li> <li>▪ People from all income used bone plasters, with the highest demand among older consumers and women.</li> <li>▪ Despite the prevalence of fake products (per previous surveys), 3% believed products they purchased were fakes. 85% were unsure.</li> <li>▪ The wealthier drink wine more.</li> <li>▪ Chengdu and Shanghai are consumption hotspots.</li> <li>▪ 54% were willing to use substitutes. 30% were not.</li> <li>▪ 88% knew it was illegal to buy/sell tiger products,</li> <li>▪ 93% agreed a trade ban was necessary to conserve wild tigers.</li> <li>▪ Wild tiger status was poorly understood.</li> <li>▪ There wasn't a significant relationship, but a trend, with people most strongly disagreeing with trade ban being more likely to consume.</li> <li>▪ While urban Chinese are supportive of tiger conservation, there is a huge demand for tiger products that could resurge if the ban is lifted.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ With most people not knowing whether bone plaster contained tiger ingredients, should engage Timidity to re-brand as bone-healings, rather than tiger-bone plasters.</li> <li>▪ Lifting of ban on farmed tiger parts may cause demand for wild parts that consumers say are better. Due to low poaching costs, wild parts would undercut farmed tiger prices and are laundered into the legal market. Recommend that Chinese gov't maintain the ban and improve LE of existing ban.</li> </ul>



## PANGOLIN

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
401. Report on Chinese Public Attitude to Consumption of Pangolins and Relevant Products. March 2016. Horizon China, Dataway, funded by AITA Foundation.	<b>CHINA</b>  To assess the public perception of pangolins and products, consumption, motivation and attitudes to provide a basis and data support for pangolin protection by AITA Foundation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Online survey</li> <li>1,892 sample</li> <li>10 cities (3 large: Beijing, Guangzhou, Shanghai); 5 medium (Harbin, Fuzhou, Wuhan, Chengdu, Xi'an); 2 small (Taiyuan, Kunming)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>91% think pangolin meat consumption should be banned.</li> <li>83% think medicine consumption should be banned.</li> <li>90% believe the commercial use of pangolin will be prohibited.</li> <li>79% know pangolins are endangered.</li> <li>90% are willing to participate in the pangolin protection.</li> <li>Educated people with higher income more strongly agree on banning and are more educated on pangolin being endangered.</li> <li>28% have just heard of pangolins; 28% are aware they are mammals.</li> <li>Perception on sources of consumed pangolins: 55% from wild Chinese pangolins, 53% human bred, 43% smuggled</li> <li>Perception on method to stop consumption: 1) educate on the endangered status (33%), 2) law enforcement (29%), 3) educate on substitutes (25%)</li> <li>91% never ate pangolins; 88% won't eat in the future.</li> <li>86% never used for medication; 82% won't use in the future.</li> </ul>	
402. Pangolins on the Brink. October 2015. Report by WildAid.	<b>CHINA</b>  Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, Hangzhou, Nanning and Kunming  To measure pangolin awareness and its crisis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sample size: 3,000;</li> <li>Online survey; age: 18-55; household</li> <li>Income: 6k+ RMB for big cities and 3k+ RMB for small cities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>10% purchased pangolin products before; 18% considered buying.</li> <li>Of consumers, 66% bought medicines with scales, drank pangolin liquor (63%), with smaller % consuming scales (33%) and meat (23%).</li> <li>70% believe the products have medicinal value; the majority believing scales can cure rheumatism, skin disorders and wound infections.</li> <li>Meat is consumed largely because of "expensive status symbol" and "exotic wild animal," even though 74% believe consuming is illegal.</li> <li>63% believe pangolin products come from farmed pangolins, while 50% believe they also come from poached animals.</li> <li>Most respondents—82% believe pangolins are endangered and 96% believe pangolins should exist on earth.</li> </ul>	
403. Pangolins on the Brink. December 2015. Report by WildAid.	<b>Vietnam</b>  Hanoi, Ho Chi Minh City and DaNang  To measure public awareness of pangolins and the poaching crisis and gauge	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sample size: 815;</li> <li>CAWI (515, age 18-40) and CAPI (300, age 40+)</li> <li>People who are aware of pangolins</li> <li>Household income: above 8,500,000 VND</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4% had purchased pangolin products, while 10% had consumed meat, the majority more than 5 years ago.</li> <li>Of the consumers, many had purchased pangolin wine, meat and scales, with fewer people purchasing medicines, blood and fetus.</li> <li>Most common answers why products are consumed: It's a rare, wild meat, it has medicinal value and it's expensive and therefore shows prestige.</li> <li>7% are considering purchasing pangolin products in the future.</li> <li>8% believe pangolins have medicinal properties, but 64% undecided--heard of properties "but don't know if true."</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conduct outreach with local communities to encourage support for pangolin conservation;</li> <li>Implement demand reduction campaigns for pangolin meat and scales</li> <li>Engage key opinion leaders and launch awareness campaigns to raise the profile of pangolins</li> </ul>

## PANGOLIN

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	attitudes towards conservation		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Of believed remedies, cure for increased libido tops the list, followed by rheumatism, asthma and detoxifying properties.</li> <li>▪ 75% aware that shops get scales and meat from poached wild pangolins, but 33% believe they also come from farmed animals.</li> <li>▪ Most agree selling (93%) and purchasing (90%) is illegal.</li> <li>▪ 94% believe poaching is common, with rising trafficking (93%).</li> <li>▪ Most agree they are endangered; 98% think pangolins should exist.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Encourage China to remove pangolins from the Pharmacopoeia of the People's Republic of China and end the use of scales in patented medicines and clinical trials.</li> <li>▪ Encourage Chinese and Vietnamese TCM journals and websites to stop advocating use of pangolin scales in medical treatment.</li> </ul>
404. Pangolin Consumer Crime in Vietnam: The Results of ENV surveys and enforcement campaigns, 2011-2015 Brink. 2012. Report by ENV	<p><b>Vietnam</b> Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC)</p> <p>To develop a better understanding of why pangolin scales are used as traditional medicine in Vietnam</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Survey</li> <li>▪ Interview: TCM practitioners at 72 shops (24 in Hanoi and 48 in HCMC)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Consumer values associated with use of pangolin scales in TCM: In 2011 and 2012, ENV surveyed TCM shops in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC) in order to develop a better understanding of why pangolin scales are used as traditional medicine in Vietnam. In the surveys, ENV staff interviewed TCM practitioners at 72 shops (24 in Hanoi and 48 in HCMC). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Pangolin scales improve breast milk quality and quantity in nursing mothers. 86.1% of TCM practitioners including 17 (70.8%) in Hanoi and 45 (93.8%) in HCMC. Pangolin scales unique in this respect</li> <li>▪ Pangolin scales purge toxins from the body 70.8% of TCM practitioners (45.8% in Hanoi and 83.8% in HCMC)</li> <li>▪ Others: reducing heat (rebalancing body temperature) (30.6%), reducing fever (29.2%), and reducing inflammation (26.2%). An additional 26 other medical uses associated with pangolin scales at low rates including helping improve blood circulation, and treating acne, boils, measles, malaria, and even cancer.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
501. Perception, Price and Preference: Consumption and Protection of Wild Animals Used in Traditional Medicine. June 2014. Journal article led by Chinese Academy of Sciences et al.	<b>CHINA</b> Beijing  To assess public knowledge, perceptions and preferences toward wild or farmed materials and their substitutes used in traditional Chinese medicine (TCM).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Survey with questionnaires and stated preference experiments with different simulation scenarios</li> <li>▪ Systematic random sampling</li> <li>▪ 912 sample</li> <li>▪ 18+ year old</li> <li>▪ Data collected in 2011</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Most preferred wild animals over farm-raised and other alternatives because they believe wild materials are more credible and effective.</li> <li>▪ Although people used TCM, they poorly understand the function or composition of TCM and proprietary Chinese medicines (PCM) and paid little attention to ingredients when purchase.</li> <li>▪ TCM professionals played an important role in influencing belief that wild materials are more effective, natural with fewer side effects.</li> <li>▪ Consumers may be more willing to choose substitutes for traditional animal medicines (TAMs) derived from well-known endangered wildlife e.g. tiger bone and bear bile.</li> <li>▪ Awareness of need for species protection, or “conservation consciousness” effect on willingness to accept substitutes. As their conservation consciousness increased, the respondents were more likely to choose substitutes and less likely to choose wild-source TAMs</li> <li>▪ As the prices of wild-sourced TAMs increase, consumers tend to choose alternatives. curative effects had an even more powerful, positive impact on consumer choice, which overrode price-consciousness for some respondents.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The results suggest that there is still hope for conservation measures which seek to promote a transition to farmed animal, plant and synthetic ingredients and provide clear directions for future social marketing, education and engagement efforts.</li> </ul>
502. Consumption of wild animal products in Ho Chi Minh city, Vietnam - Results of resident and student survey. May 2011. By Wildlife at Risk (WAR), and Faculty of Biology, University of Sconce, Vietnam, National University Ho Chi Minh City.	<b>Vietnam</b> Ho Chi Minh city, Vietnam  To gain an understanding about behaviour, knowledge and attitude of residents and students towards wild animal product consumption in Ho Chi Minh City	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 4,062 residents in four districts including District 1, District 3, Phu Nhuan District and Binh Thanh District. Reliability 98.4%.</li> <li>▪ 3,562 secondary school students aged from 12 – 15 years old in Ho Chi Minh City; 34 secondary schools in four districts: District 1, District 3, Phu Nhuan District,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ho Chi Minh City resident survey: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Nearly 51% of the surveyed residents who live and work in Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC) have used wild animal products, of which 48.4 % have consumed wild animal products more than three times per year.</li> <li>▪ Food accounts for the greatest percentage of wild animal products consumed in HCMC (75.3% of people who have consumed wild animal products), followed in turn by wild animal drinks, health products, pets, and fashion and ornamental purpose. Restaurants in HCMC are the most common place for people to eat wild animal foods.</li> <li>▪ Species that are most widely consumed, and therefore are the most threatened species include snake, wild boar, stag, deer, wild fowl, porcupine, bear, civet/weasel, turtle, python, and monitor lizard.</li> <li>▪ Men consume more wild animal products than women.</li> <li>▪ Middle-aged group (of about 36-45 years old), government officers, and people with high education levels have a tendency to consume wild animal products more than other age groups,</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Stopping illegal consumption of wild animal products via communication and education programs (forms and contents relevant to each target groups: Adults and youths</li> <li>▪ Stopping illegal consumption of wild animal products via introduction of sustainable wild animal products</li> <li>▪ Stopping illegal consumption of wild animal products via government enforcement and rescue centers</li> <li>▪ Stopping illegal consumption of wild animal products via conservation programs</li> <li>▪ This research is the first effort to understand more clearly</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
		<p>Binh Thanh District; In each school, four classes from Year 6, Year 7, Year 8 and Year 9. Reliability of 98.2%</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Survey was carried out from August 2010 to April 2011 and included:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Desk research, survey area determination and questionnaire development,</li> <li>(2) Volunteer student training and survey implementation,</li> <li>(3) Data input and analysis, and</li> <li>(4) Reporting and discussion.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	<p>people with lower social working position, and people with lower education level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ People who work at state and private enterprises have a tendency to consume wild animal products more than people with other profession groups.</li> <li>▪ The consumption of wild animal products of HCMC people seems to have a tendency to increase in the future.</li> <li>▪ The majority of HCMC people eat wild meat because others invite them, they want to try new experiences or they feel the meat is more delicious.</li> <li>▪ The surveyed residents of HCMC do not know clearly about wild animal trade. They think that trading of any wild species is illegal.</li> <li>▪ The survey residents do not understand that the wild animal product consumers are the force of illegal hunting and trading of wild animal products, helping push some wild animals to the brink of extinction.</li> <li>▪ The survey residents do not care about wild animal protection, and they also are not willing to act when they see illegal trading of wild animal products.</li> <li>▪ Television and other mass media are the favorite communication channels of HCMC people. Internet will be an important tool to educate them about wild animal protection in the future.</li> <li>▪ Secondary school student survey           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The consumption of wild animal products of secondary school students in HCMC was strongly influenced by their parents and adults in their families.</li> <li>▪ Only 28.2% of surveyed students in HCMC have consumed wild animal products. Of which, 30.7% have consumed wild animal products more than three times per year. More male students consume wild animal products than female students.</li> <li>▪ Food accounts for the greatest percentage of wild animal products consumed among the students (58.8%), followed in turned by pet, ornamental purpose, health product and wild animal drink.</li> <li>▪ Most of the survey students eat wild meat because they want to try a new experience and feel the meat is tastier.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>the consumption of wild animal products of HCMC residents and the younger generation. In the future, further research should be conducted to update the situation of wild animal product consumption</p>

**MULTIPLE SPECIES**

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Students usually go to eat wild meat with their parents in specialty restaurants in other provinces or during family events such as birthdays and family gatherings at home.</li> <li>▪ Surveyed students have a good knowledge about the roles of wild animals but they do not understand well about the rarity levels of smaller wild animal that are mostly consumed.</li> <li>▪ Surveyed students do not understand clearly about the wild animal trade. They think that trading of any wild animal species is illegal.</li> <li>▪ Surveyed students are not aware that consumption of wild animal products is the driving force behind animal hunting and trading and pushing some wild animals to brink of extinction.</li> <li>▪ The survey students have a positive attitude towards wild animal protection. They are also more willing to take part in wild animal protection than adults.</li> <li>▪ Field trips are the preferred activity of the students in order to learn about wild animal protection; followed by the interactive exhibitions and games.</li> <li>▪ Television, games and websites with wild animal protection message are effective education tools for the secondary school students.</li> </ul>	
<p>503. iThink Campaign - Campaign Impact Evaluation in Vietnam. March 2016. By Rapid Asia for Freeland.</p>	<p><b>WILDLIFE</b></p> <p>Cau Giay, Dong Da, Hoang Mai, Ba Dinh, Bac Tu Liem, Hai Ba Trung, Ha Dong, Thanh Xuan, Nam Tu Liem, Long Bien, Hoan Kiem, Tay Ho districts of Hanoi.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To measure attractiveness of wildlife</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ KAP Score</li> <li>▪ Pre and post design was used: Pre-stage with no exposure to the campaign, and after a few days, post-stage with exposure to campaign materials</li> <li>▪ Target group: Age 18 up to 64 years: Residents of Hanoi, Vietnam; 50/50</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>WILDLIFE PRODUCT PURCHASING BEHAVIOR</b></li> <li>▪ Looked at several aspects of the communication objectives behind the campaign including effective reach, brand attribution, processing and attention, awareness, attitude and action objectives. The basic idea is to determine the effectiveness of the media plan as well as the creative execution. That is, did the intended target audience see the PSA and could they understand and appreciate the basic message.</li> <li>▪ Overall, 75% of the population in Hanoi confirmed that they had seen the campaign (effective reach) when shown pictures of the PSA. Amongst wildlife products buyers, effective reach was 84% and shows the campaign has done well to reach buyers of wildlife products</li> <li>▪ Of those reached, 17% could recall that FREELAND was the organization behind the campaign. This shows people may not remember the brand but may be more focused on the message</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Some 26% of people in Hanoi have bought some kind of wildlife product in the past 12 months and a high proportion (85%) of buyers of wildlife products stated that the main reason for buying was for medicine. Most of them also bought from traditional Chinese medicine stores (TCMs). Also, the myth that medicine made from wildlife products can cure health problems was rather high among buyers who claimed they had heard about it from internet. Hence, the campaign</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>products and the reason for buying them;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To identify key sources for supply of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To determine to what extent people are aware of illegal wildlife trade and source of awareness;</li> <li>▪ To develop a profile of buyers of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To measure effective reach of the 'iThink' Campaign;</li> <li>▪ To measure attitudes in relation to consumption of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To determine current and future consumer buying behavior for wildlife products;</li> </ul>	<p>split between males/females</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Data collection method: Online using a well-established online panel in Vietnam</li> <li>▪ Sampling method used was quota sampling to ensure representation of the population</li> <li>▪ Total sample size n=42</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Those who had seen the PSA were also asked where they had seen it. Internet was the media source with the highest reach followed by TV, newspaper, magazines and events (e.g. WildFest)</li> <li>▪ Processing relates to the extent to which the PSA caught people's attention and processed the message. On average, 48-67% of respondents processed the message. PSA C (Traditional Medicine) had the highest extent of PSA processing (71%) followed by PSA D (Youth Union) and B (Env Police). The PSA made them stop and think about the issue and many indicated that they would talk to others about what they had seen and heard</li> <li>▪ PSA IMPACT <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The KAP Score framework was incorporated into the analysis to measure impact and to have the ability to benchmark the result. The comparison was made between the Pre Stage and Post Stage for the same group of respondents. The sample was weighted to reflect the true proportion of wildlife products buyers and non-buyers as well as sex</li> <li>▪ Based on past evaluations with general public, the average shift for similar interventions has been 17 points on the KAP Index. Impact was found to be strongly influenced by past buying behavior of wildlife products. For buyers of wildlife, the KAP Index went up from 45 up to 68, a very significant increase. Nonbuyers of wildlife products however, were less influenced as their KAP Index was already high at 76. Still, the KAP Index for non-buyers increased to 83</li> <li>▪ When looking at the shift in the KAP Index for each PSA, there is evidence to suggest that the PSAs perform quite uniformly when it comes to sending a persuasive message to the target audience and achieving impact. However, some PSAs work better with different target audiences.</li> <li>▪ The seven PSAs were compared in terms of the impact they had on males and females as well as younger and older people. Three PSAs were found to have more impact on females. The PSA E (Comedian) works well for older age groups. The PSA C (Traditional Medicine) and B (Env. Police) had more impact on younger people. This becomes an important consideration when placing the PSA in different media channels. In summary, PSA E</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>as a whole could consider more emphasis towards traditional medicines made from wildlife to achieve higher impact. Make 3-4 of the PSAs focus around this issue and is targeted towards TCM users</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Internet penetration is very high in Hanoi and most consumers use it regularly. Social media has been a key message delivery channel for the iThink campaign including Facebook, YouTube and Zalo. With relatively high reach, internet portals in particular had the highest reach of all channels. Based on this, the current media plan seems to work well in terms of reaching consumers and should continue</li> <li>▪ Most wildlife product purchases are conducted through informal channels such as the internet, from private individuals, and open air markets. Efforts should be directed towards exploring these channels and if possible mapping them geographically and via networks as appropriate. This will help to uncover how and where consumers can best be reached and how to communicate to them more effectively</li> </ul>

**MULTIPLE SPECIES**

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To gain an insight into how the campaign can drive more traffic to the iThink website;</li> <li>▪ To determine how well the campaign has met its communication objectives;</li> <li>▪ To measure campaign impact and benchmark to past, similar initiatives;</li> <li>▪ To gain an insight into issues that may be important to incorporate into future campaigns and make specific recommendations</li> <li>▪ To evaluate awareness and impressions of the recent WildFest event in Hanoi</li> </ul>		<p>(Comedian) had the highest reach, PSA F (National Assembly) had the highest rank in terms of communication objectives followed by PSA C (Traditional Medicine) and PSA G (Actress). The lowest rank was PSA B (Env Police)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ After watching the PSAs, 94% of respondents said they would definitely/maybe visit the iThink website. The clear majority, 96%, said they would share with friends, 92% would follow Freeland in social media followed by share comments about Freeland in social media (91%) and read stories (90%).</li> <li>▪ WILDFEST EVENT               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ More than half of respondents were aware of the WildFest Event that was held on Nov 8, 2015. Those who had heard about the event were also asked about the source of awareness. Facebook was the media source with the highest reach followed by news media, TV and word of mouth through family/friends</li> <li>▪ Those aware of the WildFest event were asked whether they had visited OGC/WildFest website/Facebook. Most respondents (79%) said they had visited on of the sites. Action taken on the sites included reading information (95%) followed by sharing with friends (91%) and watching the VDO (55%).</li> <li>▪ Those aware of WildFest event were asked if they had attended the event. Around half (52%) reported attending WildFest Event. Within this group, 17% said they learned something new about wildlife and had spoken to others about it. Another 40% said they learned something new and 36% found the event merely interesting. Only 7% stated that it was not interesting. Hence, overall the impression made was quite strong</li> <li>▪ Looking across all respondents it can be seen that 54% overall were aware of WildFest and 29% overall attended the event. We also see that the event attracted both buyers and non-buyers of wildlife products</li> <li>▪ To verify the impact of WildFest, analysis was done to compare those who attended the event and those who did not to see if there was a difference in the KAP Index. Exposure to the iThink campaign was also included to see if exposure to both resulted in a compounding effect. Comparing those who were exposed to the campaign and those not resulted in a 25 point shift on the KAP Index. Attending the WildFest event saw a 20 point shift.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Around one-third perceived low or no risk of law enforcement action if buying illegal wildlife products. Also, just over a quarter (27%) see law enforcement as a strong deterrent. Given this there appears to be scope for stronger efforts to strengthen law enforcement and the results from this study could potentially be shared with selected individuals to provide evidence as part of this effort</li> <li>▪ The PSAs are performing well in making people feel concerned about wildlife. The seven PSAs are also well positioned in terms of having impact on males and females as well as younger and older people. But some PSAs work better with some audiences than others. Hence, the media channels used for each PSA should be reviewed to ensure they are targeted to the right audience</li> <li>▪ Nearly all the PSAs seem to be effective in delivering on the set communication objectives and they complement each other. However, PSA B (Env. Police), in term of effective reach, processing and communication objectives, performed relatively worse</li> </ul>

**MULTIPLE SPECIES**

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			However, when combined the shift became 35 points and shows the two activities complement each other very well	<p>than the other 6 PSAs. PSA B should be reviewed to see if the message can be made stronger</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Consuming medicine made from wildlife products is a common practice in Hanoi but only two PSAs (A and C) talk about this issue and it appears a stronger message could be made. The ineffectiveness of medicine made from wildlife could be emphasized but important to also recommend alternatives</li> <li>▪ Some 54% of buyers believe that medicine made from wildlife can cure health problems. Internet, family/friends and Traditional Chinese Medicine Stores are the most common information sources that help to reinforce this belief. Capacity building in these channels, where possible, should be considered as a compliment to advocacy efforts for stronger focus and impact</li> <li>▪ WildFest was an event that more than half of the respondents were aware of and with a high level of attendance. Respondents who attended WildFest had a higher KAP index and when combined with the effect of</li> </ul>



## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
504. Identifying and Understanding Consumers of Wild Animal Products in Hanoi, Vietnam: Implications for Conservation Management. February 2009. By Rebecca Catherine Drury.	<p><b>Vietnam</b></p> <p>Hanoi</p> <p>To study wild animal consumers and consumption in central Hanoi</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Structured questionnaire survey (n=915) and a series of semi-structured interviews (n=77)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Scale of consumption               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 22.6% of respondents reported buying, eating or being given wild meat in the last 12 months; 23.7% reported buying, using or being given a wild animal product other than wild meat during the same time.</li> <li>○ In total, 37.6% reported consuming a wild animal product on at least one occasion in the last 12 months: 12.3% wild meat only; 15% a wild animal product other than wild meat; 8.7% both</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Urban consumers of wild animal products               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ More men than women, of all ages</li> <li>○ Businessmen, finance professionals, government officials</li> <li>○ Eating wild meat is used as a medium to communicate prestige, show respect and demonstrate business competence</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Consumers of wild animal derived medicinal products               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Consumers are of all income, occupation and gender</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Values associated with wild animals products               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Rare and precious</li> <li>○ Conspicuous consumption</li> <li>○ Doing business</li> <li>○ Influencing others</li> <li>○ Pressure to conform</li> <li>○ Shifting values, i.e. a sign of status</li> <li>○ Medicinal value</li> <li>○ Tradition</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>the PSAs campaign and shows that the two activities complement each other very well. Therefore, events similar to WildFest should be considered as a compliment to future campaigns</p>
505. iThink Campaign - Campaign	<p><b>THAILAND</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ KAP Score</li> <li>▪ Target group: Age 18 up to 64</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ WILDLIFE PRODUCT PURCHASING BEHAVIOR</li> <li>▪ The results show that some 11% of people in the greater Bangkok areas have bought medicine or a product made from wildlife in the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Internet penetration is very high and most consumers use it regularly. A key message</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
Impact Evaluation in Thailand. January 2016. By Rapid Asia for Freeland.	<p>The greater Bangkok area: Central Bangkok, Pathum Thani, Nakorn Nayok, Chachoengsao, Samut Prakan, Samut Sakhorn, Nonthaburi, Nakorn Pathorn.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To measure attractiveness of wildlife products and the reason for buying them;</li> <li>▪ To identify key sources for supply of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To determine to what extent people are aware of illegal wildlife trade and source of awareness;</li> <li>▪ To develop a profile of buyers of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To measure effective reach of the 'iThink' Campaign;</li> </ul>	<p>years Residents of the greater Bangkok area; 50/50 split between male and female</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Data collection method: Online using an already-established online panel in Thailand</li> <li>▪ The sampling method used was quota sampling to ensure representation of the greater Bangkok population and having matched samples between the exposure and control groups</li> <li>▪ Total sample size of n=300</li> </ul>	<p>past 12 months. It is not possible to pin point a particular demographic profile of wildlife products buyers, they can be male or female, young or old, and don't necessarily have to be high income earners. In other words, the buyers of wildlife products are made up from people of different ages, sex and incomes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Looking at those who bought wildlife products most recently it can be seen that wildlife products are bought for a variety of reasons. The main reason to buy wildlife products is medicine (increase from 63% in 2013 to 91% in 2015) followed by jewelry or fashion item and as decoration for the home. Some also buy it as a gift or religious item. Some 23% reported buying wildlife animals to keep as a pet</li> <li>▪ One in two people have only bought wildlife products once or twice and more than one third have bought it occasionally. Six percent of past buyers reported that they buy it regularly and was consistent with the 2013 result. It may be difficult to influence this group, but the larger group of occasional buyers can probably be influenced more easily. This shows that there is a significant proportion of past buyers who potentially could be influenced</li> <li>▪ Future intentions to buy wildlife products is influenced by past buying behavior. Past buyers of wildlife products are 12 times more likely (12%) to state that they may buy wildlife products in the future compared to those who did not buy wildlife products in the past 12 months (1%). The main reason is that they feel it is wrong to buy wildlife products (64%) and it is against the law (62%). Endangered species (57%), having no desire (56%) and don't see the benefits of buying (41%) are other compelling reasons that potentially help to deter people</li> <li>▪ EVALUATION OF PSA EXECUTION <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Looked at several aspects of the communication objectives behind the campaign including effective reach, brand attribution, processing and attention, awareness, attitude and action objectives. The basic idea is to determine the effectiveness of the media plan as well as the creative execution. That is, did the intended target audience see the PSA and could they understand and appreciate the basic message</li> <li>▪ Overall, 63% of the population in Bangkok confirmed that they had seen the campaign when shown pictures of the PSA. Amongst</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>delivery channel for the iThink campaign is social media including YouTube. With relatively high reach, internet portals in particular have the highest reach of all channels. Based on this, the current media plan seems to work well in terms of reaching consumers and should continue</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Alternatives that can substitute wildlife product should be promoted especially medicine. A high proportion of buyers of wildlife products stated that the main reason for buying was for medicine and most of them bought from traditional Chinese medicine stores (TCMs). The myth that medicine made from wildlife products can cure health problems was rather high among buyers who claimed they had heard about it from TCM stores. A more targeted approach may be considered for this channel to achieve higher impact</li> <li>▪ The PSAs are performing well in making people feel concern about wildlife, however, fear and expensive price do not appear to be strong deterrents for curbing buying behaviours. That buying or selling wildlife is against the</li> </ul>

**MULTIPLE SPECIES**

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To measure attitudes in relation to consumption of wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To determine current and future consumer buying behavior for wildlife products;</li> <li>▪ To gain an insight into how the campaign can drive more traffic to the iThink website;</li> <li>▪ To determine how well the campaign has met its communication objectives;</li> <li>▪ To measure campaign impact and benchmark to past, similar initiatives;</li> <li>▪ To gain an insight into issues that</li> </ul>		<p>wildlife products buyers, reach was 82% and shows the campaign has attracted the attention of past buyers. Of those reached, 11 percent could recall that FREELAND was the organization behind the campaign. Hence, campaign branding is on the weak side</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Those who had seen the PSA were also asked where they had seen it. Internet was the media source with the highest reach followed by billboard, BTS sky train and magazines. Exposure in newspaper has decreased significantly compared to 2013.</li> <li>▪ Processing relates to the extent to which the PSA caught people's attention and processed the message. On average, 54-71 percent have fully processed the message. The PSA made them stop and think about the issue and many indicated that they would talk to other about what they had seen and heard. The PSA featuring Nuengthida had the lowest level of processing</li> <li>▪ Execution in terms of awareness, attitude and action objective was rated very good on average. All four executions of the PSA performed relatively well. The PSA featuring Saharat performed the best in terms of highest effective reach and raising awareness while the PSA featuring Nuengthida performed relatively worse on most of the objectives. Analysis of open ended comments suggests that the images used in the PSA are not strong enough and may not reflect well on what the spokesperson is talking about</li> </ul> <p>▪ PSA IMPACT</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The KAP Score framework was incorporated into the analysis to measure impact and to have the ability to benchmark the result. In the absence of a baseline measure, comparison was made between the exposure sample, those surveyed in 2015, and the baseline sample, the control group from 2013. The 2015 sample was weighted to ensure the proportion of wildlife products buyers and non-buyers were equal to 2013</li> <li>▪ Based on past evaluations with general public, the average shift for similar interventions has been 17 points on the KAP Index. The iThink Campaign is performing significantly better, achieving an average shift of 27 points on the KAP Index for past buyers of wildlife products. Hence, performance is significantly better than the average intervention. This strongly suggests that the campaign is working and that future campaigns can build on the existing</li> </ul>	<p>law is a stronger deterrent and is a message that should be emphasized more in the PSAs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The PSA featuring Saharat had appeal and relatively stronger impact across all target segments including males and females, younger and older audiences. This PSA should be considered as a mainstream PSA</li> <li>▪ The PSAs featuring Dr. Thon and Dr. Patarapol should be considered for a more targeted audience. The PSA featuring Dr. Thon has stronger impact on older males and the PSA featuring Dr. Patarapol has stronger impact on older females</li> <li>▪ PSAs featuring Nuengthida performed relatively worse, both on appeal and impact. The results indicate the pictures used in the PSA do not reflect what the message is trying to convey. Freeland should consider replacing some of the images</li> <li>▪ An important action objective is to encourage people to support wildlife protection, go to the website etc. However, this aspect of the campaign could perform better. Each PSA ends with: "This is what I think. What do you think?"</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>may be important to incorporate into future campaigns and make specific recommendations</p>		<p>creative execution and the key target should be past buyers of wildlife.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Impact was found to be strongly influenced by past buying behavior of wildlife products. For buyers of wildlife, the KAP Index went up from 32 up to 59, a very significant increase. Non-buyers of wildlife products were influenced to a lesser extent moving up from 71 to 78</li> <li>▪ When looking at the KAP Index for each PSA, there is evidence to suggest that some PSAs may be working better than others when it comes to sending a persuasive message to the target audience and achieving impact. Again, the PSA featuring Nuengthida had the lowest KAP Index with 73</li> <li>▪ After watching the PSAs, 91 percent of respondents said they would definitely/maybe visit the iThink website. Only 9 percent said they would not visit the website and the most common reason for this was that they would probably forget or did not have time. Some also indicated there was no incentive to visit. Of the 91 percent who said they would visit the iThink website, 99 percent said they would read stories, 96% would follow FREELAND social media followed by sharing with friends (90%), and share comments on FREELAND social media (80%)</li> </ul>	<p>This leaves the call to action a bit open ended. A stronger call to action could perhaps be incorporated</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ It is very clear that knowledge, attitude and behavior has a very strong link to past purchasing behavior of wildlife products. The PSAs were found to have significantly stronger impact on past buyers of wildlife compared to non-buyers. Considering current buyers of wildlife, there is still opportunity to strengthen knowledge, especially when comparing results to the 2013 campaign. That there are endangered wildlife species in Thailand, demand for wildlife stimulate illegal trade, wildlife medicines don't cure health problems and buying wildlife products are illegal are all important knowledge that can be strengthened</li> <li>▪ Knowledge and positive attitudes were more developed amongst those who did not buy wildlife products, and the PSAs helped to reinforce compliant behavior. For this reason, the campaign appears to work well with non-buyers as well but could be strengthened with a stronger call to action</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
506. iThink Campaign - Campaign Impact Evaluation in Thailand. July 2013. By Rapid Asia for Freeland.	<p><b>THAILAND</b></p> <p>The greater Bangkok area: Central Bangkok, Pathum Thani, Nakorn Nayok, Chachoengsao, Samut Prakan, Samut Sakhorn, Nonthaburi, Nakorn Pathorn.</p> <p>- To measure attractiveness of wildlife products and the reason for buying them;</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ KAP Score</li> <li>▪ Exposure vs. Control groups. Quotas were used to ensure the exposure and control groups had similar structure in terms of sex and past buying behaviour for wildlife products</li> <li>▪ Target group: Age 18 up to 64 years; Residents of the greater Bangkok area; 50/50 split</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ WILDLIFE PRODUCT PURCHASING BEHAVIOR               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The results show that some 11% of people in the greater Bangkok areas have bought medicine or a product made from wildlife in the past 12 months. It is not possible to pin point a particular demographic profile of wildlife products buyers, they can be male or female, young or old, and don't necessarily have to be high income earners. In other words, the buyers of wildlife products are made up from people of different ages, sex and incomes.</li> <li>▪ Looking at those who bought wildlife products most recently, wildlife products are bought for a variety of reasons. The main reason to buy wildlife products is medicine (63%) followed by jewelry or fashion item (54%) and decoration for the home (53%). Around one in five/four also buy it as a gift or religious item. Some 53 percent of people have only bought wildlife products once or twice and one third (35%) have bought it occasionally. The remainder is a stauncher group representing 12 percent of regular buyer. Hence, there is a significant proportion of buyers who potentially can be influenced</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The PSA has helped to make people aware and start thinking about doing the right thing, especially amongst past buyers of wildlife. Apart from modifying one's own behavior, the recommendation is to consider a broader set of messages that can persuade people to also influence others, including:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Persuade others not to buy wildlife products especially medicine made from wildlife</li> <li>▪ Discourage others from buying wildlife pets</li> <li>▪ Inform others about laws against wildlife trade</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>REACH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ BTS Sky Train, MRT, Airport Print and Outdoor Social Media</li> <li>▪ Recommendation: It appears the chosen mix of media has worked well to reach people. It is expected effective reach will improve as the campaign continues. Reach for the PSA featuring Pongpat is significantly lower, probably due to low recognition of this spokesperson</li> </ul> <p>ATTENTION TACTICS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Video: Featuring well known spokesperson including Areeya, Kitti, Pongpat and</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To identify key sources for supply of wildlife products;</li> <li>- To determine to what extent people are aware of illegal wildlife trade and source of awareness;</li> <li>- To develop a profile of buyers of wildlife products;</li> <li>- To measure effective reach of the 'iThink' Campaign;</li> <li>- To measure attitudes in relation to consumption of wildlife products;</li> <li>- To determine current and future consumer buying behavior for wildlife products;</li> <li>- To gain an insight into how</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>between males/females</li> <li>▪ Data collection method: Data collection was carried out online and using an online panel</li> <li>▪ The sampling method used was quota sampling to ensure representation of the greater Bangkok population and having matched samples</li> <li>▪ Sample size:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Exposure group n=285</li> <li>▪ Control group n=120</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Around one in two buyers bought their wildlife products from a traditional Chinese store (49%) or in the open air market (48%). Buying from antique shops (39%), private individuals (33%) and on the internet (33%) is also popular. A relatively smaller group (11%) bought from overseas. This shows buying is widespread across a number of different channels</li> <li>▪ What is interesting is that stated future purchase intention is relatively low at 4 percent and 86 percent said that they would definitely not buy wildlife products in the future. The main reason is that they feel some wildlife species are endangered (56%) and it is wrong to buy wildlife products (55%). This is a key message of the PSA and appears to have stuck with many people. Having no desire to buy wildlife (49%) and respect for the law (49%) are other compelling reasons that potentially help to deter people from buying wildlife products</li> <li>▪ EVALUATION OF PSA EXECUTION               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Looked at several aspects of the communication objectives behind the campaign including effective reach, brand attribution, processing and attention, awareness, attitude and action objectives. The basic idea is to determine the effectiveness of the media plan as well as the creative execution. That is, did the intended target audience see the PSA and could they understand and appreciate the basic message</li> <li>▪ Overall, 63% of the population in Bangkok confirmed that they had seen the campaign when shown pictures of the PSA. Amongst wildlife products buyers, reach was 82% and shows the campaign has attracted the attention of past buyers. Of those reached, 11 percent could recall that FREELAND was the organization behind the campaign. Hence, campaign branding is on the weak side</li> <li>▪ Those who had seen the PSA were also asked where they had seen it. Internet (58%) was the media source with the highest reach followed by newspaper (52%), billboard (48%), magazine (33%), BTS Sky Train (23%) and MRT (16%). On average, people had been exposed to between 2 and 3 different media sources. This shows the power of social media and how it potentially can translate into a viral campaign.</li> <li>▪ Processing relates to the extent to which the PSA caught the attention of the target audience so they could fully process the</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wanchana. Images of suffering wildlife.</li> <li>▪ Closing: Freeland logo and website address, iTHINK-now.org</li> <li>▪ Recommendation: Attention and processing appears to be sound and the message has been recognized in several media as well. However, the call to action to visit the iThink website could be made stronger and more explicit</li> </ul> <p><b>AWARENESS OBJECTIVE</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To be aware that many wildlife products are illegal</li> <li>▪ To be aware buying and selling wildlife kills animals</li> <li>▪ To be aware that many species are endangered</li> <li>▪ Recommendation: The awareness objectives are well understood and comes across well in all four PSAs</li> </ul> <p><b>ATTITUDE OBJECTIVE</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To make people feel concerned about wildlife</li> <li>▪ To make people respect the law against illegal wildlife trade</li> <li>▪ Recommendation: The emotional appeal seems to have hit home and is in line with the prevailing attitudes</li> </ul> <p><b>ACTION OBJECTIVE</b></p>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>the campaign can drive more traffic to the iThink website;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To determine how well the campaign has met its communication objectives;</li> <li>- To measure campaign impact and benchmark to past, similar initiatives;</li> <li>- To gain an insight into issues that may be important to incorporate into future campaigns and make specific recommendations</li> </ul>		<p>message. Overall, three in four people have fully processed the message. The PSA made them stop and think about the issue and many said they would speak to others about it. Both buyers and non-buyers of wildlife products have processed the PSA to a similar extent</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Execution in terms of awareness, attitude and action objective was rated very good on average. All four executions of the PSA performed well but the one featuring Pongpat may be less suitable for the general public as less than one third recognize the spokes person</li> <li>▪ PSA IMPACT <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The KAP Score framework was incorporated into the analysis to measure impact and to have the ability to benchmark the result. In the absence of a baseline measure, comparison was made between the exposure sample, those who had seen the PSA, and the control sample, those who had not seen the PSA. Quotas were used to ensure an equal split of recent wildlife products buyers and non-buyers in each group</li> <li>▪ The KAP Index for buyers of wildlife was 32 and for non-buyers it was significantly higher at 71. Following exposure the PSAs, the KAP index rose to 67 for buyers of wildlife and 78 for non-buyers. Based on over 21,000 interviews with general public in 21 countries, the average shift for similar interventions has been 17 points on the KAP Index. For buyers of wildlife, the FREELAND PSA achieved a better result with a 35 point increase on the KAP Index. Whilst the shift is much lower for non-buyers (7 points), it is good to see the campaign helps to influence past buyers of wildlife products.</li> <li>▪ The high risk group amongst buyers of wildlife was 64 percent and shows that there is a significant group of people in Bangkok who potentially could buy wildlife products without understanding the negative effect of doing so. Following exposure to the PSA, the high risk group was reduced down to just 34 percent, so nearly half</li> <li>▪ After watching the PSAs, 94 percent of respondents said they would definitely/maybe visit the iThink website. Only 5 percent said they would not visit the website and the most common reason for this was that they felt it would not make a difference.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To encourage people to take action to support wildlife protection</li> <li>▪ To discourage people from buying wildlife products</li> <li>▪ Recommendation: This call to action can be extended to other support activities that people can do that indirectly support the cause. Consider to make the calls to action more explicit by telling people to visit the website to engage in some way</li> </ul>

## MULTIPLE SPECIES

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<p>The remaining one percent were not sure. Of the 94 percent who said they would definitely/maybe visit the iThink website, 70 percent said they would read stories followed by sharing information with friends (54%), follow FREELAND on Facebook or Twitter (46%) and share comments on Facebook (46%). It is interesting to note that people are more comfortable sharing comments on Facebook rather than making comments directly on the website itself</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>FUTURE MESSAGE DEVELOPMENT</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The four PSAs tested appears to be working well and to some extent they complement each other. Each PSA has its own strengths and no single PSA can be said to outperform the others. The only significant difference lies in the recognition of the spokes persons used. Recognition and reach of the PSA featuring Pongpat is much lower amongst the public and hence this PSA may be better suited for a target audience that is more closely involved with law enforcement</li> <li>▪ It is very clear that knowledge, attitude and behavior has a very strong link to past purchase behavior of wildlife products. The PSAs were found to have significantly stronger impact on past buyers of wildlife compared to non-buyers. Knowledge in terms of making people aware that there are endangered species in Thailand and that they suffer as a result of the illegal trade is a point that comes across very clearly. However, that medicine made from wildlife is not an effective cure and the fact that buying wildlife products is illegal could be emphasized to a greater extent</li> <li>▪ With respect to attitudes the good news is that positive attitudes are more prevalent than negative ones. Amongst buyers of wildlife, the strongest negative attitudes are ignorance (medicine made from wildlife is just as good as modern medicine if not better) and oblivious (Many wildlife products have been used for generations and people have the right to sell them). The PSAs help to strengthen positive attitudes as well as weaken negative ones and shows the emotion tactics used in the PSAs are working well. It will be important to align future campaigns to these predominant attitudes and using emotional appeal should work well for many people</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	



**MULTIPLE SPECIES**

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Looking at behavior it can be seen that many are discouraged from buying wildlife products, particularly past buyers. The PSA has certainly made people think about the issue and there is a sense that people may have become more cautious. Whilst some past buyers of wildlife products may still buy them in the future, there is a clear indication that they would consider taking other actions that can contribute to the broader campaign objective, including               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Persuade others not to buy wildlife products</li> <li>○ Voice supporter join an action program to support wildlife protection</li> <li>○ Report a store who is selling illegal wildlife products</li> <li>○ Not buying wildlife products as a gift</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Behavioral intent overall, even after exposure to the PSA, is on the low side and there is still room for improvement. The PSA has met its main objective to help making people aware and start thinking about doing the right thing. By focusing on the indirect actions recommended above, there may be potential to build momentum through peer pressure. The iThink Campaign has stronger influence on past buyers but may not fully engage them. A consideration could be to have separate messages for buyers and nonbuyers of wildlife products, thereby having messages that are more relevant and targeted</li> <li>▪ These actions could be linked to the social media strategy at iTHINK-now.org. Traffic to the site is currently lower than expected and is probably a result of not having a clear enough call to action that tells people what to do. The FREELAND logo is also shown at the end of the PSA but very few could recall the PSA was put out by FREELAND. Similarly, the website address is shown at the end of the PSA but may not be a clear enough indicator for people to go there. What people do indicate, is that they are willing to go to the website and hence, if this is not happening then that is an indication that the call to action needs to be stronger</li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
601. <i>(Elephant)</i> Offline marketing monitoring for ivory in 2016 in China. 2016. IFAW.	<b>CHINA</b>  14 provinces and municipalities in China.  To conduct offline marketing monitoring for wildlife products focusing on ivory, rhino horn and tiger bones.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Record</li> <li>Only antique and collectable markets were visited. The priority focus of the monitoring was ivory, but rhino, tiger and pangolin products were also recorded when seen.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conducted Jan-Dec 2016</li> <li>437 shops visited and 2564 ivory products seen</li> <li>In addition, 6 rhino horn, 35 tiger and 21 pangolin products recorded.</li> </ul> <p>IVORY:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>437 shops visited, 2564 ivory products seen.</li> <li>The most ivory products seen (top 10) in cities of Chengdu, Chongqin, Jinan, Beijing, Jilin, Tianjin, Hangzhou, Qinhuangdao, Qingdao, Xi'an</li> <li>Commonly seen ivory products are carved small pieces including pendant, bracelet, bangle, and small accessories; raw ivory and larger pieces are not commonly seen in illegal shops</li> </ul> <p><i>The priority focus of the monitoring was ivory, but rhino, tiger and pangolin products were also recorded when seen.</i> RHINO HORN, TIGER AND PANGOLIN</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Among 437 shops visited, 6 rhino horn products, 35 tiger products and 21 pangolin seen</li> <li>Rhino horn mostly seen as old traditional medicine (TCM), few as pendant</li> <li>Tiger products seen included tiger bones teeth, fingernail, whisker, old tiger skin wallet and bone handicraft</li> <li>Pangolin products seen included fingernail and scale carving</li> <li>The authenticity of tiger and rhino products were determined based on staff experience, product price and the authenticity of other products in the same store</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>N/A</li> </ul>
602. <i>(Tiger)</i> Briefing on the Manufacture of Tiger Bone Wine in China. 2013. Report by EIA.	<b>CHINA</b>  Hunan (where tiger bone wine is made)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Informal interviews with staff from tiger wine companies</li> <li>Audio-visual evidence and other information obtained through undercover investigations as well as desk-based research</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Trade in products from wild and captive tigers is prohibited by CITES. In China law, sale and purchase of tiger products are prohibited.</li> <li>Gov't Notification 2005 No. 139 concerns "a pilot project to enable the use of captive-bred tiger bone in medicine and reduction of use of leopard bones."</li> <li>From investigation, China allows legal trade in skins from captive-bred tigers, often for luxury home décor; commercial use of bone from captive-bred tigers continues for wine-making; and (3) skins of wild tigers and other Asian big cats are still smuggled from India/ Nepal.</li> <li>Tiger wine isn't publicly sold and can't be found in retail outlets. It's sold through direct sales at wine company office or distributors. It is also found online.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Gov't clarifies to what extent use/trade in captive tiger products is legal;</li> <li>LE action be taken against those acting illegally;</li> <li>Laws/policies amended to end trade from all sources;</li> <li>Stockpiles are consolidated and destroyed;</li> <li>Messages to breeders, industry and consumers that all demand must end for</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
603. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Analysis of Trend in Illegal Online Wildlife Trade in China November 2016. A Research by Internet Research Institute (IRI)	<b>CHINA</b>  China Analyze the trend of wildlife cybercrime in China	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Information gathering and analysis (data obtained from 1. Publicized Illegal wildlife trade cases 2. Online public reporting of illegal wildlife trade cases 3. TenCent for the Planet WeChat platform</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ According publicized wildlife crime cases, ivory, pangolin, python, rhino horn, primates and tortoise are the mostly traded wildlife or wildlife products. Among them ivory is involved in 48% of the cases.</li> <li>▪ Ivory, python, tortoise, rhino horn and pangolin are the mostly traded species online.</li> <li>▪ During January to May 2015, among publicized wildlife cases 30.6% involved online trade. This number increased to 46.3% during January to May 2016.</li> <li>▪ During January 2015 to May 2016, 54% of the wildlife trade cases are cross-board trade while 46% of the cases are within country.</li> </ul>	<p>trade in tiger products from wild and captive.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Enhance public education especially targeting endanger species commonly traded as pet.</li> <li>▪ Increase joint effort by online platform providers and enforcement authorities</li> </ul>
604. <i>(Multi-species)</i> “Consumer behavior” change we believe in: <u>Demanding reduction strategy for endangered wildlife</u> . 2014. By Zhao Liu, Zhigang Jiang, Hongxia Fang, Chunwang Li and Zhbin Meng.	<b>CHINA</b>  China  To describe how we can make approaches and strategies to change consumer behaviour and to strengthen demand reduction efforts on endangered wildlife products in China	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Review article</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Understanding consumer behaviors <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Understanding all the factors that influence the behavior you want to change is an essential starting point. Research is needed for both individual consumers and consumers in their social and culture settings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Micro-level factors shaping individual behaviors such as consumption need and motivations, personality, perceptions, behavioral learning, attitudes, habits, values and lifestyles.</li> <li>○ Macro-level influence factors of reference groups and family, social class and status, and the culture</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Developing specific “marketing strategies” to change behavior based on the understanding of all factors affecting consumer behaviors</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Behavior Change Models <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ TRAFFIC “5 steps approach” to reduce demands for endangered wildlife products</li> <li>▪ The mechanisms that determine consumer behavior can be illustrated by ‘Needs-Opportunities-Abilities’ (NOA) Model <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Consumers are shown to require a combination of needs (largely emotional motivators)</li> <li>○ Opportunities (e. g. access to the goods they wish to consume)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Abilities (e. g. adequate discretionary income) in order to purchase a product.</li> <li>○ Demand reduction initiatives thus typically attempt to disrupt 'need', whereas supply reduction initiatives typically attempt to disrupt 'opportunity' or 'ability'</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Another fundamental theory of change for a social marketing, or Pride campaign, based on the stages of behavior change models including: Knowledge, Attitude, Interpersonal Communication, Barrier Removed, Behavior Change, Threat Reduction and Conservation Results</li> <li>▪ Conservation actions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Awareness campaigns in the area of wildlife trade have focused very much on the provision of information to the public. However, one of the weaknesses of this approach is that information does NOT always lead to action</li> <li>▪ Some studies demonstrate that focusing on and achieving behavior change was not only possible but relevant to a range of conservation issues</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ The challenge is to mainstream these principles and techniques amongst conservation professionals, which would undoubtedly help make research about the human dimensions of biodiversity management and a more evidence-based conservation practices</li> </ul>	
605. <i>(Multi-species) Wildlife trade, consumption and conservation awareness in southwest China. March 2008. Academic article by Beijing Normal University; Conservation International; IFAW.</i>	<p><b>CHINA</b></p> <p>Guangxi, Yunnan and Qinghai</p> <p>Record the species and volumes of endangered wildlife in trade. Understand the overall trade, the source of wildlife for the trade and</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Field and market investigation (observation)</li> <li>▪ Information gathering (reviewing case records, talking to shops and dealers)</li> <li>▪ Multi-phase random sampling</li> <li>▪ (Including data from the IFAW urban ivory survey 2007)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The main sites for wildlife trade are ports, border markets, and market sand stores in cities.</li> <li>▪ Trading purposes: Food e.g. snakes and monkeys; Medicine and tonic e.g. tiger bone, bear bile; Crafts and souvenirs; Garments and decoration e.g. tiger skin; and Pet e.g. turtles, peacocks.</li> <li>▪ Ruili city, Dehong prefecture is the largest trading port of entry between China and Myanmar.</li> <li>▪ &lt;50% think no wild animals should be consumed.</li> <li>▪ Those consumed voluntarily did so from word of mouth, media or professionals' influence.</li> <li>▪ For food, taste and nourishment are primary motives in Shanghai and Guangzhou.</li> <li>▪ Most consumed out of curiosity, with the idea that wild animals are rare.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Establish a wildlife trade control &amp; monitoring network.</li> <li>▪ Enforcement capacity building</li> <li>▪ Increase knowledge. High percentage of urban residents is still not clear about what wild animals are protected.</li> <li>▪ Prevent wildlife from reaching the markets by working with border villagers.</li> <li>▪ Wildlife consumers are young, educated with high</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	transportation routes.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>While about half of the respondents agreed that wildlife should be protected, 60% of them had consumed wildlife at some point in last 2 years. Law and regulations on wildlife trade control are insufficient.</li> <li>The main consumption groups in China are male and young people with high education levels and good incomes.</li> </ul>	income. College students are potential consumers and should be educated.
606. <i>(Pangolin)</i> Recent pangolin seizures in China reveal priority areas for intervention. Short running title: Network analysis of China pangolin market. December 2016. Wenda Cheng I, Shuang Xing I, Timothy C. Bonebrake.	<b>CHINA</b> To summarize recent pangolin seizure data reported in public media from China between 2008 and 2016, including often neglected small seizure incidents reported in Chinese.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Comprehensive search in Google using key Chinese words meaning “pangolin” and “seized”</li> <li>Beyond quantifying seizures, conducted analyses with seizures that had both source and destination information within China.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>While China has introduced pangolin trade restrictions, the country continues to represent the largest market and destination for pangolin products</li> <li>From January 2008 to March 2016, 21,377 kg of scales and 23,109 individual pangolins were recorded in a total of 206 seizure reports, equivalent to 65,849 individuals in sum. Of these seizures, 148 (representing 88% of the total seizure individual equivalents) had source and destination information used in the network analyses.</li> <li>Guangzhou, Fangchenggang and Kunming were identified as key nodes of the illegal pangolin market.</li> <li>When considering seizure incident number, Fangchenggang (Guangxi), Dehong (Yunnan) and Shenzhen (Guangdong), border cities with Vietnam, Myanmar and Hong Kong respectively were the largest import cities</li> <li>Degree centrality highlighted Fangchenggang as the top indegree (importer) and among the top five outdegree (exporter) cities in both seizure incident numbers and amounts and Vietnam was the top outdegree country in both seizure incident numbers and amounts. Bootstrapping, however, identified the top indegree city as Kunming instead of Fangchenggang in both seizure quantity and incident numbers</li> <li>Betweenness centrality showed that for all indices, Guangzhou had the highest betweenness value (highest influence on pangolin transfer), followed by Changsha and Kunming. Bootstrapping results however, supported Kunming as the top city for all betweenness indices</li> <li>The fragmentation index showed that elimination of trade in six cities could reduce the total trade volume by almost 90% in both seizure amount and incident numbers. Kunming had the highest fragmentation rank. For reciprocal distance, six cities were found to account for 94% of the incident numbers network and Guangzhou alone could account for 47%. However, the seizure amount network only built up to 19% of the full network with the top five important cities. Bootstrapping for fragmentation identified Guangzhou as the most important city (i.e.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Guangzhou, Kunming, and Fangchenggang were identified as key target cities in terms of trade flow (degree centrality), trade control (betweenness centrality) and market intactness (fragmentation). Interventions in these cities could have a disproportionately strong impact on the entire illegal pangolin trade network. We also identified Vietnam as the largest volume source country for illegal pangolins seized in China.</li> <li>Of the key cities, Guangzhou tops almost all indices in our analysis. Pangolin consumption has become a status symbol as both scarcity and demand have increased, and Guangzhou has the highest reported rate of wildlife consumption in China</li> <li>Kunming is another important trade nexus where pangolins are efficiently imported from Myanmar and Vietnam</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<p>key player that could best fragment the network) in the seizure amount network.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ One priority should be the spread of information about pangolins and the environmental consequences of their use in TCM to the general public to change attitudes regarding pangolin exploitation (Lui &amp; Weng 2014) and emphasize that no reliable clinical efficacy of scales has been reported.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Similarly, Fangchenggang marks another major entry point for pangolins transported from Vietnam to China, consistent with Vietnam's increasing role in illegal wildlife trade</li> </ul>
<p>607. <i>(Rhino) Has demand for rhino horn dropped in Vietnam?</i> October 2014. By Scott I. Robertson, Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS).</p>	<p>Viet Nam Hanoi</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Skeptical about the campaign result (e.g. 77% decrease in the number of people who buy or use rhino horn in Hanoi) and required greater scrutiny before accepting these conclusions. Arguments:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Are statistically robust monitoring frameworks of consumer attitudes and behaviors in place?                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ To date, only 4 consumer studies focused on rhino horn, gathered a variety of data on demand in Viet Nam (2012–2013). Only 3 of these carried out in-depth analyses, but with different objectives and data collection methods</li> <li>○ A restricted sample size, varying in how representative they are, and in the framing of the questions. These surveys all had different objectives and therefore adopted different methods, asked different questions</li> <li>○ Insufficiently consistent to be useful in measuring trends in consumer behavior</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Do other indicators suggest a similar conclusion?                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Consumer awareness-raising initiatives are a critical component to demand reduction, alone they do not provide a comprehensive solution</li> <li>○ in addition to analyses of the data from surveys focused on the attitudes and behavior of consumers, it is also useful to compare the surveys' results with information available on the other measures that would indicate changes in the demand market:                     <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Monitoring availability of RH in Vietnam (online sales and traders remain active in providing rhino horns to Vietnamese consumers and also to Chinese customers visiting Viet Nam)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To properly understand demand for rhino horn in Asia a robust monitoring program is required that consists of repeated, standardized surveys assessing attitude, awareness, behavior and related indicators (e.g. policy, poaching rates, law enforcement, market size and availability) over time in key consumer countries. This program would be greatly facilitated by coordination and cooperation between non-governmental organizations and governments.</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
608. <i>(Rhino) Project proposal: Breaking the brand of rhino horn in Vietnam.</i> By Lynn Johnson, PhD	<p data-bbox="443 898 548 927">VIETNAM</p> <p data-bbox="443 984 632 1341">To outline a potential approach to tackling the rapidly rising demand for rhino horn in Vietnam, the primary market driving a recent spike in rhino killings in South Africa</p>	■	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="1121 370 1591 508">■ “When the buying stops, the killing will too”, but it is hard to understand the claim that demand has significantly fallen in Viet Nam in the context of the lack of decrease in rhino poaching in Africa</li> <li data-bbox="1121 513 1591 651">■ Enforcement effectiveness - no noticeable increase in law enforcement efforts (i.e. arrests, prosecutions or effective punishments) towards people buying or selling rhino horn</li> <li data-bbox="905 656 1591 898">■ Do we really understand the demand markets for rhino horn?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="1024 678 1591 816">○ Anecdotal information only and premature to conclude Vietnam is the main market and destination for RH (How about China?) – a grater evidence-base is required on the location of key consumers of RH in Asia</li> <li data-bbox="905 821 1591 898">■ How do we assess the impact of individual campaigns?</li> </ul> </li> <li data-bbox="879 846 1591 898">■ Attribution is both hard and questionable overall value: Which was most successful in changing perceptions and behaviors</li> <li data-bbox="879 902 1591 984">■ Vietnam’s population of about 92 million people, with approximately 80% of the populace under the age of 40 and 72% of this majority under the age of 24. The median age is 27.8 years (2011 data)</li> <li data-bbox="879 989 1591 1143">■ Astonishing economic growth, growing at 7% annually over the period, based on an aggressive commitment to economic liberalization and international integration (CIA, 2011). As a result, GDP per capita has nearly doubled between 1999 and 2011 to \$3,400pp in 2011, even though the population grew by nearly 15 million over the same time frame</li> <li data-bbox="879 1148 1591 1229">■ Large population of overseas Vietnamese, with around 1.8million in the US and 200,000 in Australia (the most preferred destinations for Vietnamese students who wish to study overseas)</li> <li data-bbox="879 1234 1591 1286">■ The number of Internet users in Vietnam has grown from basically zero to 24million between 2002 and 2009</li> <li data-bbox="879 1291 1591 1372">■ It would appear that even going to extreme measures in protecting the animals from poachers is not going to stop the rising demand and increasingly sophisticated poaching and smuggling operations</li> <li data-bbox="879 1377 1591 1424">■ The demand is not driven by ancient culture or traditional medicine, but rather by the aspirational demands of a rapidly increasing class of</li> </ul>	■

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<p>young and affluent people. This means that these groups will be susceptible to the types of brand building and shaping campaigns perfected by Western advertising agencies over the last 50 years</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 3 key consumer groups of rhino horn in Vietnam ( a July 2012 report by TRAFFIC): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Habitual users on the social circuit: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Motivation for consumption: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Sense of belonging to exclusive circle</li> <li>▪ Social Status, Recognition</li> <li>▪ Self-medication for hangovers</li> <li>▪ Peer group pressure</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ Campaign options: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Celebrity based campaign making rhino horn 'uncool'</li> <li>▪ Mirror Lynx anti-fur campaign</li> <li>▪ Social media campaign</li> <li>▪ Promoting a substitute</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Family of terminally ill patients (e.g. cancer): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Motivation for consumption: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Presumed miracle cure</li> <li>▪ Guilt – do whatever it takes to keep the family member alive</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ Campaign options: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Targeted awareness/education campaign for doctors/nurses</li> <li>▪ Palliative care training</li> <li>▪ Vilifying the 'touts' in hospitals</li> <li>▪ Scientific study showing lack of efficacy</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Affluent mothers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Motivation for consumption: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Duty to protect their babies</li> <li>▪ Presumed efficacy to tackle high fever in infants (link to traditional use)</li> <li>▪ Peer group pressure</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ Campaign options: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FUD (fear, uncertainty, doubt)</li> <li>▪ Elicit empathy with rhino babies losing their mothers</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>	



## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Social media campaign</li> <li>▪ Scientific study showing lack of efficacy</li> <li>▪ In addition:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Expat Vietnamese living in Australia for 30+ years use rhino horn &amp; tiger paw – bring back to Australia from a holiday in Vietnam visiting family: Gift giving and using it for children to “make them strong”</li> <li>○ Overseas business people operating in Vietnam who come from cultures where ‘saving face’ is an important cultural consideration (e.g. China, Japan, Korea). Rhino horn could be used as a deposit in the purchase of luxury items such as cars – Rhino horn is used in Vietnam as a “status” gaining/affirming gift.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Consumer awareness:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ No awareness of where rhino horn stems from and how it is obtained in reality that is by killing the animal</li> <li>○ 90% of what is sold as rhino horn in Vietnam is fake (TRAFFIC report)</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ The traditional efficacy ascribed to rhino horn is its ability to lower high fever, especially in children. All other claimed properties are recent and without any basis in published research.</li> </ul>	
<p>609. <i>(Rhino) Breaking the brand of rhino horn in Vietnam. The first 12 months. 2014. By Lynn Johnson, PhD</i></p>	<p><b>TRAFFIC</b> Hanoi, HCMC</p> <p>To summarize the first 12 months of the Breaking the Brand project (launched in Feb. 2013). This project was created to address the spiraling demand</p>	<p>▪ Sole focus on demand reduction by targeting the primary users of genuine rhino horn, NOT those groups using fake rhino horn, in Viet Nam.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Established clear user profiles of the primary groups using genuine rhino horn in Viet Nam through telephone interviews with several users in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City and gained further insight through the support of individuals in the Vietnamese community in Melbourne.</li> <li>2. Analyzed and established the motivations to use rhino horn.</li> <li>3. Analyzed and established the motivations to stop using rhino horn.</li> <li>4. Shared and cross-checked our analysis and findings with representatives of established conservation organizations – including TRAFFIC, FFI, The Rhino Rescue Project together with independent conservationists and zoologists.</li> <li>5. Translated the motivations to use and stop using rhino horn into designs for adverts to directly target the two primary user groups.</li> </ol>	<p>▪</p>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	for rhino horn from Viet Nam		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. Established a relationship with an international advertising agency (Grey Group) who are doing pro-bono work to help create behaviour-change adverts to target the primary users.</li> <li>7. Completed the process of creating the first 5 adverts including photo shoot and translation into Vietnamese.</li> <li>8. Selected target publications for the adverts and established relationship with media buying agency in Viet Nam.</li> <li>9. Raised over USD\$ 20,000 via donations, two crowd-funding campaigns and fundraising events.</li> <li>10. Established an internet presence by creating a website: <a href="http://www.breakinghtebrand.org">www.breakinghtebrand.org</a> and a social media presence on Facebook, Twitter and Pinterest.</li> <li>11. Built a strong relationship with the key people in the SAVE African Rhino Foundation.</li> <li>12. Invited to present pilot campaign and the behaviour change model at annual Zoos and Aquarium Association Conference in Auckland in March 2014 to over 120 representatives of zoos and aquariums worldwide.</li> <li>13. In response to several requests, created workshop on the behaviour change model and methods used in creating the Breaking the Brand campaign to help other conservation organizations deliver effective and targeted behaviour change campaigns</li> <li>14. Built relationships with conservancies, conservation groups and individuals committed to saving the rhino in South Africa, Kenya and Zimbabwe.</li> <li>15. Started the process of gaining mainstream media exposure with the help of freelance writers, authors and other supporters together with recent commitment from MacGregor Public Relations to do media strategy and support pro-bono.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Primary users:                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Primary user 1: High Status Businessmen                       <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Senior Businessmen/Finance Professionals/ Government Officials.</li> <li>○ Group values rarity and expense rather than perceived medical properties.</li> <li>○ Acquiring rare produce associated with money, power and skill.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ol>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Rhino horn gift used to demonstrate respect and competence when negotiating deals.</li> <li>○ Gifts used to influence and obtain preferential treatment from those in positions of power.</li> <li>▪ Only 2 motivators to stop using:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Negative impact on personal status as a result of using/giving rhino horn.</li> <li>○ Negative impact on health from using rhino horn</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Primary user 2: Affluent mothers               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Believe in fever-reducing qualities of rhino horn - in line with use in Chinese /Vietnamese medicine.</li> <li>○ Keep small quantities at home in case child gets a high fever.</li> <li>○ Also buy for aging parents.</li> <li>○ Relatively recent trend.</li> <li>○ Unclear if using fake vs. genuine rhino horn.</li> <li>○ A group heavily influenced by social media.</li> <li>○ Small individual quantities but large group size.</li> <li>○ Interested and aspire to celebrity mothers.</li> <li>○ Again very status conscious and aspiration</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Primary motivator to stop using:</li> <li>▪ Negative impact on family health from using rhino horn</li> </ul>	
<p>610. (Multi-species) <a href="#">A matter of attitude: The consumption of wild animal products in Hanoi, Vietnam.</a> A TRAFFIC report 2007 funded by DANIDA.</p>	<p><b>TRAFFIC</b></p> <p>Hanoi, Vietnam</p> <p>To understand the level of awareness among the general public in Ha Noi regarding the need for wild animal conservation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ July through November 2005, included four components: desk research, in-depth interviews, a questionnaire/survey, and focus group discussions.</li> <li>▪ In-depth interviews: With owners/managers of specialty wild animal restaurants to investigate the tastes, habits,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Results               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Nearly 50% of the Ha Noi residents surveyed have ever used wild animal products, of which 45% consume such products up to three times per year.</li> <li>▪ Food accounts for the greatest percentage of wild animal products consumed in Ha Noi, followed by health products such as bear bile and tiger gelatin.</li> <li>▪ Men consume wild animal products more frequently than women.</li> <li>▪ Affluent and highly educated people are more likely to use wild animal products than those with less money and education.</li> <li>▪ Wild animal food and products are status symbols enjoyed especially by business people and government officers.</li> <li>▪ Wild animal consumption is usually a group social activity, with wild animal meals predominantly purchased by one host, rather than sharing the cost among consumers at a given meal.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p><b>METHODS:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There is a need to coordinate with popular news and entertainment websites, especially those used by youth, in order to place both advertisements and links to informative articles.</li> <li>▪ Wild animal trade campaigns should incorporate the lessons learned from other sectors, in terms of factors such as broadcast timing, style and means of communication</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>The survey looks at the consumption of terrestrial mammals, birds, reptiles and amphibians, but does not address the consumption of fish or insects</p>	<p>behavior and level of consumption of their customer base</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The questionnaire: Profiled individuals for the purposes of analyzing patterns of wildlife use in Ha Noi.</li> </ul> <p>Developed, field-tested with approximately 20 respondents and then revised accordingly. Questions to permanent Ha Noi residents aged 18 and older. Five districts four urban and one peripheral-were targeted as sites for data collection. A total of 2005 survey responses were collected and thus form the basis for this analysis</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Following up on the survey, focus group discussions were held in order to clarify and expand upon key points</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The most frequently cited reason for not using wild animal products was that they were too expensive.</li> <li>▪ Residents of Ha Noi believe that the use of wild animal products is popular, fashionable, increasingly affordable, and on the rise in nation's capital.</li> <li>▪ The majority of Ha Noi residents are not aware of key legislation that protects endangered animal species and their habitats.</li> <li>▪ Most people do not understand the impact that their own consumption has on the environment.</li> <li>▪ People in Ha Noi mainly get their scientific information about wild animals from television and are most interested in shows about the biological characteristics of wild animal species.</li> <li>▪ The Internet has major potential as a tool for reaching younger generations with positive wildlife conservation messages</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Wildlife consumption is more prevalent during particular times of the year, and thus communications efforts must take this into account</li> <li>▪ Key target audience should be those with more education and higher levels of income/status</li> <li>▪ There is a need to continue to reinforce conservation messages over a lifetime, through both formal and informal educational sectors</li> <li>▪ Celebrities should be strategically evaluated for inclusion in communications campaigns to address various aspects of consumers' attitudes toward wild animal consumption</li> </ul> <p>MESSAGES:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Should address the underlying assumptions and belief (wildlife as food and medicine).</li> <li>▪ Should increase the sophistication and depth of understanding of consumers regarding wildlife products</li> <li>▪ Should specifically target social networks in order to help de-legitimize these behaviours</li> <li>▪ Mass media messages should try to generate the feeling of a connection between</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
611. <i>(Multi-species)</i> <u>Exploring urban demand for wild species in Vietnam: Consumer characteristics and the social context of consumption</u> By Rebecca Drury, Fauna & Flora	Vietnam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Structured survey (n=915) and semi-structured interviews (n=78)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Scale of consumption               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 22.6% reported consuming wild meat in the last 12 months, 18% reported consuming bear bile</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Characteristics of consumers               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ High earning male professional aged 25 eats wildmeat at business occasions with work colleagues</li> <li>▪ High earning businessmen aged 39 who often takes business partners to wildmeat restaurant</li> <li>▪ Female consumers are invited to eat wildmeat by male colleagues, friends or family members, less enthusiastic and less knowledgeable about wildmeat than men</li> <li>▪ Wildmeat consumption is significantly correlated to belonging to the high family income. Wildmeat is an expensive specialty and</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>animals and humans, and emphasize the role people play as stewards of the planet. More culturally and personally relevant.</p> <p>GOVERNMENT AND BUSINESS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Newspapers are a particularly effective way to convey messages to government employees and businesspeople</li> <li>▪ Both government and private sector should consider adopting policies to discourage illegal and unsustainable wild animal consumption among their employees, e.g. Tet</li> <li>▪ There is a need to pursue enforcement efforts in such a way that it does not further raise the perceived status - and hence desirability - of particular wildlife products.</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
International (FFI).			<p>perceived as wealth as main characteristics of wildmeat consumers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Family income has no significant influence on consumption of wild animal-derived medicinal products</li> <li>▪ Government officials are significant wildmeat consumers: powerful individuals in high status occupations or successful people</li> <li>▪ Context of consumption <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ ~59% takes place in restaurant</li> <li>▪ Wildmeat is frequently referred as rare, precious. It is considered fashionable and associated with leading a luxurious way of life</li> <li>▪ Wildmeat is rare and expensive food, it is used to show respect and demonstrate competence when negotiating deals and initiating new business relations.</li> <li>▪ 41.3% of events occurred around Hanoi, the remainder occurred in 22 provinces and dominantly in Ha Tay (11.6%)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
612. <i>(Rhino)</i> Shutting down the rhino horn trade. October 2013. By WWF/TRAFFIC Illegal Wildlife Trade Campaign		▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increasing demand from Asia, and especially Viet Nam, is driving a poaching crisis on the African continent with poaching levels in South Africa having risen by a staggering 5000% just between 2007 and 2011</li> <li>▪ Governments have the power to stop this and WWF and TRAFFIC want to help them. Through a national campaign in Viet Nam WWF-Viet Nam and TRAFFIC aim to secure a high level, public commitment and action plan from the government that will; shut down the illegal rhino horn trade in Viet Nam; reduce consumption of rhino horn through public awareness raising and secure a commitment of the Viet Nam Government to lead a demand reduction program, and boost enforcement activities, including seizures and prosecutions</li> </ul> <p>16. The current poaching crisis for African rhinos is driven almost entirely by demand in Viet Nam, where it is valued as an ingredient in traditional medicine to treat a variety of ailments from fever to hallucination and headaches, as well as, as a status symbol of wealth and power</p>	▪
613. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Evaluating behaviour change interventions: A case study in	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Collate information regarding already launched</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Qualitative</li> <li>▪ Determine behavior change interventions based on the information</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 9 interventions (10 organizations responsible for the interventions) seeking to reduce rhino horn consumption, none addressing ivory consumption in Vietnam, but 3/10 organizations mentioning work related to ivory:</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1. All interventions should determine measurable, achievable and timely objectives so evaluation can be possible</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
Vietnam. September 2015. By Alegria Olmedo, Imperial College London (Submitted for the MSc in Conservation Science).	<p>conservation interventions with behavior change goals in Viet Nam, for rhino horn and elephant ivory consumption.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Understand the planning and research that developed these interventions.</li> <li>• Determine how these programs were designed, monitored and evaluated</li> <li>• Identify examples of good practices and lessons learned from the</li> </ul>	<p>provided in Sharif's (2014) compilation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Further research on internet was conducted to have an initial understanding of the campaigns</li> <li>▪ Draw up a list of interventions: 9 interventions aimed at demand reduction for rhino horn and ivory and analyzed</li> <li>▪ Approach and discuss with the organizations responsible for these interventions</li> <li>▪ Create a social marketing wheel and compare results of the interventions against this wheel to analyze the success</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ TRAFFIC: conducted market surveys and online research to measure the prevalence of the market, have this information to design a strategy (T. Nguyen, pers comm).</li> <li>▪ ENV: dealing with the problem "on the surface level" only</li> <li>▪ HSI: will publish and distribute a children's book I'm a Little Elephant soon</li> <li>▪ In addition, TRAFFIC, FREELAND and ENV recognize a market for ivory does exist but the latter two agree that it is insignificant, especially when compared to markets in Thailand and China; WWF and the CITES M.A. agree that Viet Nam only plays the role of transit country for ivory; TRAFFIC also describes Viet Nam as a transit country for ivory heading to China.</li> <li>▪ Main uses of rhino horn: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Main motivation: Social status (ENV, Breaking the Brand, FREELAND, TRAFFIC), thus wealthy people must be targeted and messages must be developed to resonate with them. However, they also recognize an "underlying belief in medicinal properties". Per ENV, TM values will continue existing in Vietnamese culture but those who consume rhino horn for this purpose could continue buying it and would not drive the species to extinction</li> <li>▪ Main motivation: Medicinal properties (HSI, the CITES M.A., WWF and WildAid/CHANGE). RH is expensive but a small piece is needed for medicinal purposes so it can be afforded by everyone from "all walks of life". In addition, "they choose RH for a reason. Because they believe in it, not for status."</li> <li>▪ Tackle consumption without targeting a specific main driver (Wild Act and WCS). "Can't separate."</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ How to achieve behavior change <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Public pressure: focus on its profile (WildAid/CHANGE)</li> <li>▪ Targeting consumers directly (TRAFFIC, WWF, HSI/CITES M.A. and Breaking the Brand)</li> <li>▪ Law enforcement (WCS)</li> <li>▪ Awareness raising (Wild Act, FREELAND, HIS/CITES MA)</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ 4/9 (HIS, WildAid/CHANGE, TRAFFIC, Breaking the Brand) carried out research to identify consumers of rhino horn and reasons driving consumption and 1/9 (ENV) carried out to discover the medicinal properties</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 2. Any behaviour change intervention needs to be based on behaviour change models</li> <li>▪ 3. All interventions expected to influence behaviour should have a previously determined theory of change including indicators</li> <li>▪ 4. Indicators of success should not be confused with indicators of progress</li> <li>▪ 5. Consider culture, values and beliefs as much as possible before developing any campaign</li> <li>▪ 6. If an organization does not have the skills or expertise to collect and analyze social data, or lead and monitor social marketing campaigns, partners who can do this accurately and transparently, such as academics, must be consulted</li> <li>▪ 7. Find common ground in which to collaborate with other organizations to delegate research, development of messages and launching of campaigns to avoid lack of trust</li> <li>▪ 8. Use lessons learned from other organizations' work</li> <li>▪ 9. Learn from experiences in other fields regarding how to use social marketing to achieve behaviour change</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	Viet Nam case study Determine a framework of elements to include in behaviour change interventions, including how research and evaluation can be carried out in the future.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1/9 (TRAFFIC) interventions that had objectives that can be measured in quantifiable terms</li> <li>▪ One conducted consumer research studies, but most used already existing research or their own experience to identify the main RH consumers, then designed messages</li> <li>▪ Only 2/9 used behavior change models (TRAFFIC and Breaking the Brand)</li> <li>▪ Only 2/9 produced baselines to compare results (HIS/CITES MA, TRAFFIC). However, other indicators of success have been used, e.g. social media, pledges, anecdotal, people reached/trained. Practitioners are doubtful whether proper evaluation measures can be recorded from behavior change interventions</li> <li>▪ Compared with the social marketing wheel, no inclusion of these components of behavior change programs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 10. Do not assume behaviour change approaches that have worked in other countries can be applied successfully in Viet Nam</li> <li>▪ 11. Work thoroughly on understanding the ivory market in Viet Nam before designing any intervention to target consumers</li> </ul>
614. <i>(Multi-species)</i> <u>Commercial wildlife farms in Viet Nam: A problem or solution for conservation?</u> 2008. Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS)	Mekong Delta (Dong Thap, Ca Mau, Hau Giang, and Kien Giang provinces); South-east (Ba Ria Vung Tau, Binh Phuoc, Dong Nai and Binh Duong provinces and Ho Chi Minh City); South-central (Quang Nam province and Da Nang City); and the Red River Delta (Vinh Phuc province)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 800 farms distributed in 38 provinces</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Direct exploitation of wild populations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 42% of farms surveyed (with existing breeding populations and reliable information) were regularly bringing in animals from the wild. 50% of farm owners reported their original founder stock to have been sourced from the wild or from a combination of wild and farm stock.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Even fast-breeding, small species had negative conservation impacts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Even farms for fast-growing species with relatively high reproductive rates, and low feeding costs (e.g. python, wild pig, porcupine and cobra) were found to be bringing in wild stock. This indicates that even for these species farms do not substitute exploitation of wild population</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Animal escapes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 20% of the wildlife farm owners reporting animal escapes. This included animals that pose a threat to humans (e.g. pythons, cobra, and crocodiles), those outside of their natural distribution range (e.g. Chinese soft-shell turtle in the south of Vietnam), and unnatural hybrids (e.g. Soft-shell turtle).</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Farm owners linked to the illegal wildlife trade <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Several farms reported selling to traders near the Chinese border to illegally export their sale product. Others openly reported illegally buying farm stock from commercial hunters, providing economic bribes to enforcement agencies, illegally</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Prohibits wildlife farms holding protected species listed in Group IB of Decree 32/2006/ND-CP and globally-threatened species listed in the IUCN Red List;</li> <li>▪ Stipulates strict penalties to apply to farm owners who breach wildlife protection laws</li> <li>▪ The burden of evidence on proving the source of animals being held in farms lies with the farm owner and not the enforcement agencies</li> </ul>



## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
615. <i>(Elephant)</i> Vietnam's illegal ivory trade threatens Africa's elephants. 2016. By Lucy Vigne and Esmond Martin. Save the Elephants.	<p><b>RETRACTED</b></p> <p>HCMC, Buon Ma Thuot, a village in Central Highland, Hanoi, Artisans' villages around Hanoi</p> <p>To obtain ivory prices and to survey retail outlets and ivory items in the main areas known to sell worked ivory.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Survey on elephant ivory trade in Vietnam from 23 November to 14-December 2015</li> <li>▪ Interviews, survey, counting retail outlets, items, ...</li> <li>▪ Compared with data from past surveys</li> <li>▪</li> </ul>	<p>transporting their products, illegally importing stock and illegally possessing other species of wildlife</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Feeding the rich, not the poor               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Wildlife farms provide luxury products (including meat, leather, and pets) to urban consumers with no consumption by rural communities as a source of dietary protein</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Is wildlife farming a tool for conservation?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ These results show that wildlife farming is a negative development for the conservation of wild populations</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ There is no conservation benefit from breeding of animals in farms with little or no prospect of them being returned to the wild, no awareness-raising activities, no funds being directed towards the conservation of wild populations and no conservation-related research. Animals are only truly conserved if they are playing their natural role in functioning ecological systems.</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Nearly all elephant tusks coming into Vietnam today are from Africa, and they are all illegal to trade.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ HCMC: Most customers of ivory items in the retail outlets are Chinese as ivory is cheaper here than in China: businesspeople who come to buy and smuggle back home, Vietnamese who are of Chinese origin, not only rich Vietnamese but also poor (e.. woman selling coconuts, cold drinks etc.)</li> <li>▪ Buon Ma Thuot: Customers are mostly East Asians, especially Chinese and Vietnamese visitors. Tourists who come to Buon Ma Thuot like to buy ivory here to remind them of seeing the elephants. They are not being told and are not concerned that nearly all the ivory originated in Africa and is not even carved here.</li> <li>▪ Tourist village in Central Highlands (beyond the entrance to Yok Don National Park): Tourists come from the big cities in large coaches, and after their elephant ride, they may do some shopping or walk to a nearby river with a rickety traditional wood bridge, also with shops selling souvenirs, including small ivory items and other small wildlife products.</li> <li>▪ Hanoi: nobody interested in buying ivory items in Hanoi. The Chinese, being the main customers, are told by their tour guides and interpreters to visit the nearby villages where the artisans make and sell ivory items at far reduced prices.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
616. (Multi-species) The Social Trade Network: Facebook's Relationship Status with Wildlife Traders in Vietnam. 2016. Nguyen. T. 2016. The social trade network: Facebook's relationship with wildlife traders in Vietnam. WildAct, Hanoi, Vietnam.	Vietnam Facebook	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>online market survey focusing on Facebook, 6 months from October 2015 – April 2016</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Artisans' villages: Few Vietnamese buyers, mainly items produced for the mainland Chinese market</li> </ul> <p><b>ELEPHANT</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>29 Vietnamese Facebook accounts were found advertising elephant products, such as ivory, foot stumps, whole tail or tail hairs. A total of 1,055 advertisements and 20,930 elephant products were recorded. Elephant ivory or suspected ivory carved into jewelry were the most popular items: 69% of products advertised were jewelry (23% rings, 19% pendant, 18% bangle, 8.5% beads and bracelet) and 15% were ivory carved into Buddha figurines.</li> <li>Whole elephant tails and tail hairs were advertised on 100% of ivory traders' Facebook accounts. They are either sold unprocessed, or use as decoration on carved ivory. In fact, 10% of carved ivory items used elephant tail hairs as decoration. Tail hair was also often advertised as to "ward off evil spirit".</li> <li>A total of 1,171 comments were made on advertised elephant products by 991 Facebook accounts between October 2015 and April 2016. On average, 1.1 comments were made per advertisement, with 84.6% of commenters making a single comment. The consumers came from 63 out of 68 provinces and cities in Vietnam, mainly from Ho Chi Minh City (22.2%) and Hanoi (19.2%)</li> <li>A majority consumers of elephant products, including elephant tail hairs, are married males (85.5%) and low skilled labors (49.8%). The elephant product consumer group is the most diverse group in terms of occupation. It is worth mentioning that government officers, armed forces and people working at high management level (Director, CEO) accounted for 10% of ivory consumers. People who participate in religious practice, such as Buddhist monks, including those from Mongolia, Thailand and Cambodia are often found asking for ivory beads. Illegal wildlife traders, including those trading on Facebook are found involved in trading elephant products with each other, including those from overseas.</li> <li>Consumers of elephant products are also highly educated, with 59% educated to college and university level. Most of them are aged 20 – 40 (86.4%). In addition, the illegal trade of ivory and suspected ivory on Facebook in Vietnam also attracted attention from a wide range of foreigners, with 33% of comments coming from Portuguese people, followed by 18% from Cambodian and 12% from Singaporean</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<p><b>BIG CATS INCLUDING TIGER</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consumers are male (98.3%), non-financial professionals (48.7%). Government officers and people work at high management level (Director, CEO) accounted for 5% of big cat product consumers. 52% of the consumers were married.</li> </ul> <p><b>PANGOLIN</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consumers and potential consumers of pangolin scale are mostly married males and self-employed. The scales were carved into Buddha plates and for sale as a lucky charm. The pangolin body was sold as food, with scales removed. Most people who show interest in this advert are married, female, non-financial professionals. Their comments show interest in purchasing the animal, and exchanging different methods for cooking the meat. None show any concern or knowledge of violating the law.</li> </ul>	
617. <i>(Elephant)</i> Polishing off the ivory: Surveys of Thailand's Ivory Market. 2014. Naomi Doak. A TRAFFIC report.	<p><b>THAILAND</b> Bangkok</p> <p>To carry out monthly surveys in Bangkok retail outlets offering ivory for sale</p> <p>January – April 2013 and October 2013– May 2014</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Focused on 119 shops from ten general locations around Bangkok identified in previous work (Martin and Stiles, 2002; Stiles, 2004; Mather undated; Stiles, 2009) with additional locations and retail outlets identified and recorded each month.</li> <li>Data collected</li> <li>Photos taken as needed</li> </ul>	<p>Between January–April 2013 and October 2013–May 2014, TRAFFIC carried out monthly surveys in Bangkok retail outlets offering ivory for sale including any newly identified outlets conducting surveys across 4 - 5 days each month. Visits to each market area were conducted on consecutive days in each month. Surveys were conducted without the vendors' knowledge or prior warning to ensure items were not removed from view and that surveyors were not chased away from the retail outlets.</p>	<p>Results from the latest surveys were similar to those from earlier work (Martin and Stiles 2001, Stiles 2006–2007, Stiles 2008), with 167 individual locations identified in total but with an increase in the number of locations across the duration of the surveys. The highest number of retail outlets visited in any one month was 162 in May 2014 and the lowest number of outlets visited was 71 in January 2013. During the survey period, the number of ivory retail outlets varied. Some shops were closed at the time of the survey, or had closed completely or changed from a shop offering ivory to another type of store. Meanwhile, new individual retail</p>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
618. <i>(Elephant) Control of Elephant Ivory Trade in Thailand: Under the New Legal Framework</i>	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Review of new legislation</li> </ul>	<p>Thai government passed a suite of new laws and regulations, and amendments to existing laws, aimed at closing the loopholes for illegal ivory trade and implementing a comprehensive registration system for domestic ivory and ivory traders. These amendments include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. the Elephant Ivory Act B.E. 2558 (2015) (“Elephant Ivory Act”), which was enacted on 21 January 2015 with the objective of regulating and controlling the trade, import, export, transit and possession of elephant ivory and any products originating from domestic elephant ivory. As a result, anyone in possession of ivory – whether for personal use and/or for commercial purposes – was required to register all items in their possession with the Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation (“DNP”) prior to 21 April 2015;</li> <li>2. amendments to the WAPPA requiring any individual in possession of African elephant ivory to register such ivory. These amendments also mean that any ivory from an African elephant which has not been registered will be subject to forfeiture;</li> <li>3. the Ministerial Regulation by the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (“MNRE Regulation”), which came into force from March 2015, extended domestic protections under the WAPPA to African elephants. These changes expressly prohibit the domestic trade in African elephant ivory. These changes also introduced new penalties for the illegal trade or possession of African elephant ivory of up to four years’ imprisonment. This is also the first time Thailand has included a non-local wildlife species as a protected animal under the WAPPA, so as to prohibit possession and/ or trade of African elephants and their parts, including ivory; and</li> <li>4. amendments to the Beasts of Burden Act to provide for</li> </ol>	<p>outlets were found—either due to a change in stock to items including ivory, or new ivory outlets that had not been recorded in previous months. Even in May 2014, the eighth consecutive month of the most recent survey period, new ivory retail outlets were still being identified.</p>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
619. <i>(Multi-species) Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), TIME FOR ACTION: End the criminality and corruption fueling wildlife crime, 2016</i>	THAILAND Southeast Asia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The methodology used by EIA involved extensive desk-based research of publicly available information and outreach to key stakeholders, where possible. EIA also monitored trade levels of key species with a focus on tigers and other Asian big cats, elephants, rhinos, pangolins, helmeted hornbill and totoaba. Thousands of records of seizures, arrests and prosecutions have been analysed to produce seven interactive map on wildlife trade, available on website: <a href="https://eia-international.org/">https://eia-international.org/</a></li> </ul>	<p>new and enhanced registration and monitoring of trade in domesticated elephant ivory.</p> <p>All 15 IVT countries have (in place) some basic infrastructure and capacity to investigate and prosecute those implicated in the wildlife trade chain and to ensure meaningful penalties are imposed to reverse the high-profit/low-risk nature of wildlife crime, including the recovery of proceeds of crimes. Failure to tackle the criminality, corruption and weak governance associated with wildlife crime, combined with imprudent laws in some countries which facilitates wildlife trade, has accelerated the decline of many wildlife species</p>	As a matter of urgency, the Heads of State and heads of key government agencies must issue directives assigning political and financial resources to combat wildlife crime, resulting in the priority actions
620. THAILAND <i>(Pangolin) Global Ecology and Conservation, Where did all</i>	Asia and Africa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The CITES Trade Database was queried for all pangolin species trade data</li> </ul>	No previous study, has analyzed CITES trade data for both African and Asian pangolins. Here, we found a massive increase in trade of African species after 2000, while Asian species trade has decreased. Again, it should be emphasized that these results do not reflect trafficking in pangolins, but only trade reported to CITES. There has been a dramatic	We, therefore, recommend that all trade, legal and illegal, should be monitored closely and enforcement efforts should be enhanced considerably. The

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
the pangolins go? International CITES trade in pangolin species, October 2016		between the years 1975 and 2014 for all 'Sources', 'Purposes', 'Trade Terms', 'Importing Countries', and 'Exporting Countries', as a comparative tabulation report.	switch from Asian to African species, and as Asian populations have declined, we predict the same to happen in African populations.	establishment of the new mandatory annual illegal trade report, with the first report due in October 2017, is also a step in the right direction. It should emphasize, however, that the report on trafficking and seizures should be kept separate to the legal trade data to avoid confusion and in order to unmistakably distinguish between them.
621. <i>(Multi-species) Wildlife Value Orientations in Thailand: Preliminary Findings, 2007</i>	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Seventy semi-structured interviews were conducted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The study found eight wildlife value orientations (WVOs) including Materialism, Mutualism, Caring, Symbolism, Attraction, Repulsion, Concern for Human Safety, and Environmentalism. Caring, concern for Human Safety, Mutualism, and Attraction were the most prevalent WVOs among Thai people in this study. Findings are discussed in light of the reality of the Thai society. Implications for future research are provided as well.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>
622. <i>(Elephant) Laohachaiboon, S. (2010). Conservation for Whom? Elephant Conservation and Elephant Conservationists in Thailand. Southeast Asian Studies, 48, 74-95.</i>	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Review of the Thai Elephant Conservation Center (TECC) and the National Elephant Institute (NEI)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TECC struggled to sustain organizational survival while simultaneously concretizing their activities for internationally acclaimed elephant conservation in the 1990s.</li> <li>Secondly, NEI experienced difficulty in balancing its expected roles after 2002 in protecting elephants in collaboration with local communities, as well as functioning internationally as a lynchpin of the nation for elephant conservation.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>
623. <i>(Elephant) Stiles, D. (2009). The Elephant and Ivory Trade in Thailand. TRAFFIC</i>	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interviews, monitoring &amp; assessment survey</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Although the quantity of worked ivory seen openly for sale has decreased substantially from approximately 88 000+ specimens observed in 2001 to 23 000+ specimens found in the 2006/2007 survey, Thailand still has one of the largest and most active ivory industries seen anywhere in the world. The illegal portion is probably exceeded only by China-Hong Kong SAR.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extensive recommendations can be found within this article</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	Southeast Asia. Pedaling Jaya, Selangor, Malaysia.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The total number of retail outlets surveyed in Thailand was 201 and the number of ivory items observed was 23 258 during the research period in 2006/2007. Of all locations visited, Bangkok had the largest observable ivory trade with 151 outlets and 12 517 items; Phayuha Kiri was next with eight outlets and at least 7611 items; followed by Chiang Mai with 26 outlets containing 2323 pieces; and the Uthai Thani area with eight ivory workshop-outlets selling 361 items in five of the outlets visited.</li> <li>▪ In 2008, TRAFFIC found 69 additional outlets to the number in 2006/2007 selling ivory in Thailand with 3019 items. Bangkok had 63 additional outlets with 2901 items, Chiang Mai had three more outlets with 73 pieces, and Phayuha Kiri had three additional outlets with 145 items.</li> <li>▪ There were fewer hotels selling smaller amounts of ivory items in 2007 than in 2003. In 2003, 17 hotels were found selling 5355 pieces and in 2007 this had declined to seven hotels with 1352 items. One of these hotel shops had ceased selling ivory in 2008. Raw ivory prices increased on average over 300% between 2001 and 2008 in Thailand.</li> </ul>	
624. <i>(Elephant)</i> Still in Business: The Ivory Trade in Asia, Seven Years after the CITES Ban. TRAFFIC International, Cambridge, UK.	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Impact Evaluation of CITES ban seven years after enactment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Review of all countries in which the CITES ban is active Kilograms of ivory seized by year and location</li> <li>▪ Thailand continues to be a destination for shipments of raw ivory. There is data linking the illicit trade of ivory between Thailand, Ethiopia, and Djibouti. There have been multiple large seizures of worked-ivory coming out of Thailand in multiple location.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>
625. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Understand Thai consumers.	THAILAND	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Thai people' characteristics: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Thailand is a Buddhist country</li> <li>▪ Thai people believe in superstition</li> <li>▪ They believe in karma</li> <li>▪ There are social superiors e.g. monks, elders, etc.</li> <li>▪ Thais do not like to be confronted or embarrassed</li> <li>▪ They do not like to be judged or blamed</li> </ul> </li> <li>➔ Entertaining with a twist</li> <li>▪ How to reach:</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The use of internet and social media in Thailand has increased rapidly during the past few years. Internet marketing has become one of the most popular medium used to communicate with consumers. It is effective, more personal and much cheaper than traditional media</li> <li>▪ Use of social media: gender equally, aged 15-24: 45.2%; aged 25-34: 29.5%; aged 35-44: 14.3%; aged 45-54: 6.9%, aged 55+: 4.2%</li> <li>▪ Messages and themes (Based on the surveys from Rapid Asia from ARREST evaluation):               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Thai audience feel sympathy for the animals which are victims of wildlife trafficking</li> <li>▪ Talking about fear or expensive price do not appeal to Thai audience</li> <li>▪ Talking about the fact that wildlife products can be illegal is important to Thai audience</li> <li>▪ They want to know how they can help and action(s) that they can immediately do to help</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Target audience:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ “Gen-Z’s Responsible Icons” : Generation Z is a group of young people who are looking for opportunities to be a hero/heroine. They admire people like Malala Yousefsai or Jazz Jennings and want to be like them. This help campaign for social responsibility to work better and easier as there are supporters in the society ready to help spread the word</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
626. <i>(Elephant)</i> Market surveys find disturbing increase in Thai ivory market. 2014. TRAFFIC in In Asia	THAILAND	▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The number of worked ivory products found for sale rose from 5,865 in January 2013 to 14,512 by May this year, while between January and December 2013, the number of ivory retail outlets rose from 61 to 105</li> <li>▪ The quantity of ivory found exceeds the limited supply available under current Thai legislation that allows sale of ivory from domesticated animals, meaning the vast majority of ivory being sold is illegal under international commitments</li> <li>▪ At least 20,000 African Elephants were killed in 2013 poached for their ivory to meet the heavy demand from Asia, where Thailand has the unenviable reputation as home to one of the world’s largest unregulated ivory markets. Asian-run transnational organized criminal gangs are believed to be behind much of the trafficking.</li> </ul>	▪



## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 75-year old law that permits legal trade in ivory from domesticated Asian Elephants in Thailand. But with no registration system in place it is impossible to trace the ivory, creating a loophole for ivory from illegal sources to be laundered into the marketplace.</li> <li>▪ The maximum quantity of ivory that the country's domesticated elephants could produce is estimated at 650 kg annually, a quantity that is “considerably less than what was observed in Bangkok markets,” according to the report</li> <li>▪ The illegal origin of the ivory for sale comes from several large-scale seizures of African-sourced ivory heading to or seized in Thailand in recent years. Since 2008, over 13 tons of African Elephant ivory have been seized in such transactions</li> </ul> <p>Despite international bans on ivory sales and regulations outlawing the movement of ivory across international borders, several of the ivory retail outlets in Bangkok have signs targeting Chinese buyers, directly undermining China’s own efforts to discourage the purchase of ivory by its citizens traveling abroad. In 2013, Thailand welcomed 26.7 million visitors according to the Thailand Tourism Authority, with China topping the chart at 4.7 million arrivals, a 69% jump from 2012 while overall tourist numbers were up almost 20%.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Despite the fact that elephants are an important part of the country’s identity one of the most problematic countries worldwide in regards to the illegal ivory trade</li> </ul>	
<p>627. <i>(Multi-species)</i> World wildlife crime report: Trafficking in protected species. 2016. UNODC.</p>	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Global</p> <p>To present wildlife crime situation with a focus on illicit trafficking of specific protected species of wild fauna and flora, and provides a</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ VERY IMPORTANT</li> <li>▪ This report represents two years of comprehensive research, based on the latest and best available data.</li> <li>▪ Includes a quantitative market assessment and a series of in-depth</li> </ul>	<p>GENERAL RELEVANT OUTCOMES OF THE RESEARCH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Some illegally traded forms of wildlife feed primarily into illegal retail markets, such as ivory</li> <li>▪ When illegally traded wildlife is introduced into legal commercial streams, criminals have access to a much larger source of demand than they would have had on the black market alone</li> <li>▪ Species can be legally traded internationally if accompanied by the appropriate paperwork (for traffic wildlife, permits acquired through forgery, fraud or corruption)</li> <li>▪ Customs agents form the front line of enforcement (ports of entry, rather than in domestic markets)</li> <li>▪ Some wildlife farms, captive breeding operations, or even zoos may play a role in laundering illegally acquired wildlife.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ This report highlighted several significant gaps: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Informational</li> <li>▪ Legislative</li> <li>▪ Operational</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>broad assessment of the nature and extent of the problem at the global level</p>	<p>illicit trade case studies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The quantitative analysis has required the construction of a World Wildlife Seizure database (World WISE), rooted in seizure data provided to the CITES Secretariat by its Parties and to the World Customs Organization (WCO) by its membership. These data were circulated to Member States for verification.</li> <li>▪ This database alone may not be sufficient to describe but provides key indicators and a potential early warning mechanism.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Informal harvesting practices can allow internationally protected wildlife to be illegally introduced into commercial streams before being legally exported</li> <li>▪ Some high value species appear to have become the object of speculation, where price becomes detached from retail demand, complicating generalized demand reduction campaigns</li> </ul> <p>Art, Décor, and Jewelry - ELEPHANT case study</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Illegally traded forms of ivory feed primarily into illegal retail markets</li> <li>▪ Ivory has become the object of speculation</li> <li>▪ Ivory was recognized as a precious commodity, a medium of which high art was made. With growing market restrictions, this exclusivity has been enhanced</li> <li>▪ The known legal market for ivory is much smaller than the estimated illicit supply. Question: Does legal market for ivory have the potential to launder much illegally acquired ivory?</li> <li>▪ The largest national destination market for detected ivory shipments appears to be China. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ &gt; 800 raw ivory seizures between 2006 and 2015, for a total of just under 123 metric tons of ivory. For those seizures where the destination of the ivory was reported (104 metric tons), about 40% (42 metric tons) were directly destined for China.</li> <li>▪ About 60% of the weight of the ivory seized in Malaysia was destined for China, according to the Malaysian authorities</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ At least two-thirds of the ivory seized is destined for East Asian markets (ETIS in 2007)</li> <li>▪ Retailed markets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Internet/on-line sales of small items (including dark web) where buyers and sellers of ivory meet electronically</li> <li>▪ small objects are being sold in illegal venues not currently monitored</li> <li>▪ Back-room dealing</li> <li>▪ Speculation</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Food, Tonics, and Medicines - PANGOLIN case</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Pangolin is consumed as both a meat and a medicine (scales). Their skins were used in the exotic leather trade</li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There are 8 species of pangolins (all classified as “Vulnerable” by the IUCN), 4 species in Africa and four species (2 classified as “Critically Endangered” and 2 as “Endangered” by the IUCN) in Asia; They have been consumed traditionally as food in both regions, and their scales are also used in traditional medicine.</li> <li>▪ In Asia, whole scales are sold, raw or fried, from traditional medicine retailers. These scales have multiple uses in traditional medicine: to cure skin diseases, improve blood circulation, and to stimulate milk production in lactating women.</li> <li>▪ Pangolins are also consumed as food in both Africa and Asia. In some Asian culinary traditions, pangolins are presented live before being slaughtered for the meal, so the illegal live trade of pangolins is commonly seen. Whole frozen pangolins are also shipped for use as meat. Between 2007 and 2015, together pangolins seized that were destined for culinary use accounted for about 55,000 pangolins.</li> <li>▪ Many of the seized pangolin scales originating from Africa were found in mixed consignments, alongside rhino horn or ivory. Most (92%) of these shipments were destined for China or Viet Nam.</li> <li>▪ Demand: The seizure data illustrate that the primary destination market for illegal international trade in pangolin is Asia, particularly China and Viet Nam. These two countries have documented markets for pangolin as a medicine and a food.</li> <li>▪ Semi-structured interviews in China and Viet Nam have provided some insight into the demand for scales and meat: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Scales are sold through traditional medicine shops in both countries.</li> <li>▪ Pangolins have been deemed commercially extinct in China.</li> <li>▪ A survey of 18 high-end restaurants in Viet Nam found that pangolin meat was available in all of them, and in 16 of them, it was the most expensive item on the menu. Rising demand for pangolin products is evinced in rising prices in Viet Nam</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ The zero export quotas for the Asian range states appear to have decimated the market for pangolin skins. In contrast, the market for pangolin meat appears to be almost entirely illegal, and many metric tons of contraband pangolin have been seized destined for this market</li> <li>▪ As is the case with elephants and rhinos, buyers appear to be turning to the four African species of pangolin that do not enjoy protection in Asian destination markets.</li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Per World WISE, between 2007 and 2013, an average of over 15000 live pangolin equivalents were seized annually. This is likely a fraction of the actual illegal trade.</li>   <li>Food, Tonics, and Medicines - RHINO case study Rhino horn: Medicine, status symbol and jewelry and décor items</li> <li>▪ Rhino horn has historically been used in traditional medicine in Asia to treat fever and cerebrovascular disease. More recently, belief its efficacy in treating other ailments, from hangovers to cancer appear to have increased demand</li> <li>▪ The prices usually cited in the tens of thousands of dollars per kilogram</li> <li>▪ Demand for this horn has grown greatly over the past 10 years, driving an escalating wave of poaching.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ “pseudo hunting”, in which staged hunts were held so that horn could be exported to illicit markets</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Beginning around 2006, the number of rhino sport hunting applications for rhinos in South Africa began to increase.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Between 2007 and 2010, an average of 116 rhinos were hunted in South Africa each year, as compared to between 35 and 70 per year previously.</li> <li>▪ These applications were coming from people with no prior hunting experience, particularly citizens of Viet Nam, a country from which applications had not been received before. 84/111 applications in 2009 to 116/166 in 2010, declining to 112/222 in 2011</li> <li>▪ The investigation revealed that Vietnamese traders (with Czech mediators) had been recruiting Czech citizens to participate in pseudo rhino hunts for several years.</li> <li>▪ Further investigations revealed an even wider range of participants. In 2012, a Thai national pled guilty to organizing 26 “fake” rhino hunts and acting as an agent for import and export groups and companies in Thailand and Laos</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ In order of importance, Viet Nam, China, Ireland, Czech Republic, United States and Thailand are indicated as destination countries</li> </ul>	
628. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Briefing paper: Changing	MULTI-COUNTRY	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Use of Rogers’ Diffusion of</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Supply reduction – through a combination of better onsite protection, enforcement and detection, and penalties and other deterrents for those convicted of trafficking along the entire supply chain— from</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Rogers’ Diffusion model suggests that innovations amongst e.g. Traditional</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
consumer behavior: A long-term solution to the global poaching crisis. TRAFFIC & WWF. May 2014.	Vietnam, Thailand, China.  To introduce the five steps to behaviour change	Innovations Theory	source to transit to destination markets. These efforts NEED to be reinforced by reducing the main driver of the trade; the demand from the consumer end of the trade chain. This approach was aimed at dissuading consumption of illegal wildlife products. Take away the market, the supply quickly dries up and the incentive to poach is gone. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The 5 steps to behavior change: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Step 1: Identifying behaviors</li> <li>▪ Step 2: Understanding influencers by audience</li> <li>▪ Step 3: Developing a practical model of influencers on behavior</li> <li>▪ Step 4: Building a marketing strategy</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Medicine practitioners and business leaders have great potential to influence others
629. <i>(Multi-species) Mid-term performance evaluation of Asia's regional response to endangered species trafficking (ARREST) program. Evaluation report.</i> October 2013. By USAID.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Asia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mixed-methods evaluation design: combined qualitative and quantitative methods; document review, key informant interviews and a survey</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Demand reduction: It will not be possible to attribute measurable shifts in demand reduction to Freeland activities exclusively. While iThink received a positive response in Thailand, it is too early to determine the campaign's overall contributions to public awareness in all targeted countries. ARREST's impact on demand reduction might not be realized during the program period. During the remainder of the program period, Freeland could build a foundation for the achievement of long-term outcomes by refining its demand reduction strategy to focus on Behavior Change Communication (BCC).</li> <li>▪ Law enforcement capacity building: is one of ARREST's strongest activities and the furthest along of the three components.</li> <li>▪ Sustainability, Partnerships and Learning: has not yet met the overall sustainability objectives set forth in the agreement and work plans on ASEAN-WEN and PCU sustainable financing.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Advocate for the review of the ASEAN-WEN and the PCU's location in the overall ASEAN structure. This includes supporting the sovereign decision-making processes and protocols of ASEAN leadership in exploring options that will give the network the higher visibility and increased political and financial support it must have to become more fully effective and sustainable.</li> <li>▪ Continue to refine the ARREST demand reduction strategy, building upon successful awareness-raising activities and focusing increasingly on behavior change communication</li> <li>▪ Increase the attention and resources devoted by ARREST to partnerships in ways that promote</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
630. <i>(Multi-species)</i> <u>Influencing human behaviour: An</u>	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Global	▪	▪ Human behaviour is the key driver of all major threats to biodiversity. Habitat loss, climate change, invasive species and overharvesting are, in general, consequences of the lifestyle of billions of humans. In order to move from	<p>sustainability, learning and shared ownership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Invite the full-time U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) Special Agent to be assigned in Bangkok to provide expert guidance on the law enforcement component of ARREST</li> <li>▪ Consult with a gender specialist to identify opportunities to approach demand reduction and law enforcement capacity building in a more holistic manner that addresses the different roles of men and women in both sustaining and combating wildlife trafficking as appropriate</li> <li>▪ Focus ARREST implementation on the ASEAN region, on the ASEAN-China relationship, on increased work in Lao PDR and on initiating activities in Myanmar</li> <li>▪ Increase efforts to build shared local ownership and ensure that ARREST is in fact Asia's Regional Response to Endangered Species Trafficking, not just in aspiration</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
<p><u>underutilised tool for biodiversity management.</u> 2013. By Diogo Verissimo.</p>	<p>To contribute towards addressing human behaviour change by showcasing work conducted by practitioners worldwide, across different subject areas and in different landscapes and human contexts</p>		<p>nting losses and identifying causes for decline to tackling the underlying drivers and implementing solutions, we need to recognize that conservation is not only about animals and plants but equally about people and their behavior.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There is little literature on the subject of influencing human behaviour and biodiversity conservation. Reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ lack of incentives given to conservation practitioners working on education or community-based conservation to publish their research</li> <li>▪ the training of conservation professionals is still largely focused on biological sciences</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Hence, the common use of changes in awareness, knowledge or attitudes as indicators of behaviour change and changes in all of these indicators commonly precede behaviour change, or there is a direct link between them and behaviour.</li> <li>▪ These oversights are especially worrying at a time when conservation needs to move beyond anecdote, personal experience and conventional wisdom, and towards a systematic appraisal of evidence</li> <li>▪ Social marketing: An emerging field that promises to deliver insight into how to change behaviour. In terms of addressing the needs of conservation professionals, social marketing has several important features: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Its largely quantitative nature. Conservation professionals, that have a background in biological sciences, are more willing to engage with it to address behaviour change.</li> <li>▪ Strong emphasis social marketing places on metrics and evaluation (e.g. social return-on-investment)</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Payments for ecosystem services (PES): An increasingly popular type of economic incentive to conserve biodiversity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Behaviour change campaigns can increase social recognition and visibility of those involved, therefore increasing participation and adoption</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Behaviour change can also be crucial to improve the management of natural resources by local communities.</li> <li>▪ Behaviour change can offer vital support to improving law enforcement, through increasing both detection probability and the social disincentives of rule breaking</li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
631. <i>(Multi-species) Fighting illicit wildlife trafficking. A consultation with governments conducted by Dalberg.</i> December 2012. By WWF International/Dalberg.	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Central African Republic, Cameroon, China, Democratic Republic of Congo, Germany, Indonesia, Italy, Japan, Kenya, Malaysia, Thailand, United Kingdom and United States</p> <p>To provide a snapshot of current governmental and intergovernmental opinions on illicit wildlife trafficking</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 110 government and international organization representative contacted, 22 interviews conducted between June and August 2012.</li> <li>▪ The 22 interviews conducted can be classified as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ • Eight respondents from ministries of justice, commerce and internal affairs;</li> <li>• Seven respondents from ministries of environment;</li> <li>• Seven respondents from international organizations.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Rhino horn being used as a palliative medicine for cancer, along with its use as a “hangover cure” by affluent people in some countries, explains the upsurge in rhino horn trading in Viet Nam. This trade is underpinned by persistent urban myths and hype about dubious miraculous cures and cancer remission following treatments using rhino horn. As a result, the country’s appetite for the substance is playing an important role in the increase in global demand for rhino horn</li> <li>▪ Drivers of demand: heavily influenced by culture <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Medicinal products: Perceived medicinal value, such as cancer treatment, is driving demand.</li> <li>▪ Consumer goods: Associated social status is driving demand</li> <li>▪ Other drivers of demand include opportunistic buying driven by the desire to possess exotic pets, hunting trophies and rare plants and animals.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ The primary driver of demand is the social status associated with the products being trafficked. However, it is not possible to clearly quantify the relative importance of each factor and its influence on demand for wildlife products.</li> <li>▪ Current approach to fighting illicit wildlife trafficking is not sufficient; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The representatives of all governments – with the exception of China, which does not see illicit wildlife trafficking as the most urgent issue – indicated that the best result would be achieved through demand reduction in consumer countries. Economic growth in consumer countries and the associated surge in demand show that the current approach to fighting illicit wildlife trafficking is no longer adequate <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ illegal wildlife products through the internet</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ In order to address the demand side effectively, it is important to fully understand and address the causes of increasing demand. The capacity to understand and address demand is critical to influence the behaviour of consumers</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ On the demand side, the private sector can help create awareness among employees, reject the corporate “gifting” of illegal wildlife products, improve understanding of what drives consumer behaviour and support campaigns to change that behaviour. Finally, logistics companies – shipping, airline and land based transport (trucking and rail) – which facilitate the import, transit and export of goods, must</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>



## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
<p>632. <i>(Multi-species) Creative experts' meeting on messaging to reduce consumer demand for tigers and other endangered wildlife species in Vietnam and China. A meeting report.</i> November 2011. TRAFFIC and WWF.</p>	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Vietnam and China</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To identify specific messaging approaches and method for specific target audiences</li> <li>▪ To identify simple and cost-efficient method to assess, evaluate and learn from these approaches as they are implemented, and adapt them as necessary</li> </ul> <p>To focus on devising effective demand</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ More than 20 participants attended from diverse institutional and professional backgrounds: Advertising and marketing, social research, behavioral economics, public health and wildlife trade</li> </ul>	<p>take measures to prevent and penalize the abuse of their services for illicit wildlife trafficking</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The need for more effective awareness-raising campaigns to communicate the destabilizing effects of illicit wildlife trafficking. Such campaigns should target those that supply, demand or otherwise profit from illicit wildlife trafficking. In particular, on the demand side, an understanding of the fundamental factors influencing the behaviour of consumers will help to design more effective campaigns.</li> </ul> <hr/> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In developing messaging to reduce consumer demand for tigers and other endangered wildlife species, initial focus should not be on the actual messaging but on the strategic choices on which audience and what behavior we want to influence.</li> <li>▪ Addressing the primary drivers of behaviors must be at the heart of demand reduction efforts; The initial focus should not be on the specific users themselves but the attributes that drive their behaviors</li> <li>▪ Specific steps for demand reduction efforts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Identifying and redefining behaviors</li> <li>▪ Understanding the influences on audiences for such behavior</li> <li>▪ Developing a new model of influences for positive behavior change</li> <li>▪ Building a “marketing” strategy to trigger the desired behavior</li> <li>▪ Developing a communications strategy and campaign to support that strategy</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Campaigns to address consumer demand have been ineffective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There are good examples of effective approaches to address consumer demand and illegal trade, but overall they have failed because they have not been pursued on a scale large enough to have an impact or for a long enough duration to achieve measurable change, or they simply have not managed to change behaviour. Other factors – personal, cultural, societal, financial – can supersede the “rational” arguments presented by awareness-raising campaigns.</li> <li>▪ Much of the effort has been focused on factors that influence consumer preferences and behaviour, such as those in their direct environment (legislation, government policy, governance and so on). However, little focus has been geared towards social and personal factors such as group norms, values, beliefs, trends and dynamics</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	reduction strategies targeted at the distinctive cultural, socio-economic and political characteristic of the two countries being widely recognized as major wildlife consumer markets in Asia viz. China and Vietnam		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Avoid going too vague, make it doable and measurable actions that are relevant to their lifestyles</li> </ul>	
633. <i>(Multi-species)</i> What's driving the wildlife trade? A review of expert opinion on economic and social drivers of the wildlife trade and trade control efforts in Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, and Vietnam. October 2008. By TRAFFIC.	<p><b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, and Vietnam</p> <p>To generate findings and recommendations that would be useful to governments, nongovernmental organisations, donors and others in considering how interventions to reduce illegal and unsustainable</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Questionnaire was completed by 89 experts on the wildlife trade, drawn from government departments, conservation organizations, universities, scientific bodies, and independent researchers across Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Vietnam and elsewhere</li> <li>▪ The responses covered around 30 plant and animal taxa. The</li> </ul>	<p>TIGER</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In China, but also in other countries such as Republic of Korea, Singapore, Malaysia, Vietnam and Japan, the use of bones and other body parts in traditional medicine</li> <li>▪ In Chinese and Vietnamese cultures this includes the demand for Tiger meat, which is considered a health tonic.</li> <li>▪ In some Malaysian restaurants, the meat is offered as a luxury or as a novelty food. While Tiger parts are also traded for ornamental purposes, this is generally thought to be less common than in the past, with the main exception being Tibet where the demand for Tiger pelts for use in traditional clothing persisted as a key factor driving the hunting of this species in Nepal</li> <li>▪ There is increasing evidence of persistent demand for Tiger and other wild animal products</li> <li>▪ There has been some evidence in recent years, however, that demand for medicines claiming to contain Tiger products has been slowly declining, with the open availability of Tiger products in China's domestic market for traditional medicines considered to have been significantly reduced through a combination of regulatory measures and awareness campaigns. However, the proposed opening up of Tiger</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The evidence base for wildlife trade interventions needs to be strengthened</li> <li>▪ Wealth appears to be a stronger driver of illegal and unsustainable wildlife trade in south-east Asia than poverty</li> <li>▪ The design of wildlife trade interventions needs to take into account the broader conditions and trends that act to drive illegal and unsustainable wildlife trade</li> <li>▪ Laws and regulations stand little chance of success unless they are effectively implemented and enforced, and wider issues of governance are also tackled</li> <li>▪ Non-regulatory approaches to controlling illegal and</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	wildlife trade might be applied more effectively in future	questionnaire data were analyzed at an aggregate level, to give a picture of the wildlife trade overall, and detailed case studies were produced for three species groups: Tiger <i>Panthera tigris</i> , agarwood <i>Aquilaria spp.</i> , and <i>Gyrinops spp.</i> , and tortoises and freshwater turtles (various species).	product sales from Tiger farms in China, particularly tonic wine for more general consumption would be likely to reverse this trend  ACTORS <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Harvesters: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mostly professional or semi-professional male hunters, but also include, to a lesser extent, opportunistic hunting and revenge killing by locals in response to conflict with Tiger populations</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Traders: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ local middlemen where Tigers are caught by local hunters, but is dominated by high-level traders who deal directly to local processors and retailers or internationally</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Processors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Not widespread and largely consist of small-scale family-owned and -operated businesses processing for the traditional medicine market. This is particularly the case in Vietnam, but in other countries processors and retailers are usually one and the same.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Retailers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Usually established traditional medicine businesses or restaurants that supply a demand in major urban centers, servicing demand from mostly ethnic Chinese and Vietnamese people. Retailers include black-market or underground dealers who supply a limited and discrete client base.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Consumers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Usually middle- to high-income earners and in some cases, such as in Vietnam, consumption of wild meat generally is particularly associated with high-ranking government officials and the business community</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	unsustainable trade, e.g. market-based interventions and support for improvements in resource management, are under-used <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Awareness efforts to reduce illegal and unsustainable trade need to be targeted to specific audiences and their effectiveness evaluated over time</li> <li>▪ Co-ordinated packages of mutually reinforcing interventions are required to address illegal and unsustainable wildlife trade in a more comprehensive manner</li> <li>▪ Increased policy attention and action is required if wildlife trade is to be brought within sustainable levels and conducted according to national and international trade controls</li> </ul>
634. <i>(Multi-species) Wildlife crime tech challenge – Issue 3: Consumer demand.</i> Year. Funded by?	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b>  To look for technology or technology-enabled approaches, methods, or processes that can:	▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Current state of the issue: drivers of demand</li> <li>▪ Driven by a diverse set of social and cultural forces. Some are historical. Tiger bone have been consumed for centuries as food or medicine. Contemporary demand also reflects modern consumption trends. Illegal wildlife parts are used today as party drugs, to signal social status, or as gifts that show respect to authority figures. Examples include rhino horn, elephant ivory...</li> <li>▪ Patterns of demand for illegally traded wildlife and wildlife parts and products differ across the world.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Consumer profiles must be better understood.</li> <li>▪ Projects should prioritize outreach to the private sector, especially those companies working in tourism, transportation, infrastructure development, and extractive industries</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Address harmful societal norms that make it acceptable to consume illegal wildlife or wildlife parts</li> <li>● Raise consumer awareness about the illegality and negative impact of buying illegal wildlife parts</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ China is now the world's largest market for elephant ivory, having overtaken Japan and the United States in the last several years.</li> <li>○ Most of the recent growth in demand for rhino horn can be traced to Vietnam, where it is sold as a hangover remedy, cancer cure, or party drug.</li> <li>■ Studies of demand have found that in general, consumers of threatened wildlife products in Asia are educated and affluent men aged 30 and over who are in positions of influence and power, including businessmen and senior government and military officials</li> <li>■ Current efforts to reduce demand: In addition to the high level commitment of governments around the world, demand reduction initiatives are carried out.               <p style="margin-left: 20px;"><i>Examples of efforts to address harmful social norm:</i></p> </li> <li>■ Advocacy organizations use public service announcements with celebrities and social icons to relay the message that consuming threatened wildlife is 'not cool.' This has included web and social media outreach.</li> <li>■ TRAFFIC has held workshops and meetings that have encouraged leading practitioners of traditional medicine in China and Vietnam to make important statements against using threatened species in traditional medicines.               <p style="margin-left: 20px;"><i>Examples of public education/consumer awareness initiatives:</i></p> </li> <li>■ Advocacy organizations partner with technology companies to leverage social media platforms with the goal of reducing consumer demand. One organization's efforts in China have raised awareness among consumers of the fact that ivory comes from killing elephants. Campaigns like Give Peace to Elephants, Say No to Ivory Gifts rely on clever Chinese-language word play to deliver messages that resonate with local audiences.</li> <li>■ In Vietnam, the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) launched a rhino horn campaign that has reached 65 million people via mobile phone text messaging.</li> <li>■ In late 2014, Rovio Entertainment, a video game maker held a gaming tournament to raise awareness about the surging illegal trade in pangolins. In the game, players free illegally captured</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Anti-wildlife trafficking messages must be linked with trusted spokespersons</li> <li>■ Campaigns must utilize new media and emphasize public engagement and participation</li> <li>■ Conservationists have generally lacked the resources to conduct adequate evaluation of their efforts at demand reduction or to fully capture lessons learned, and the ability to adapt a message or its delivery mechanism as its effects become clear will be important</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			pangolins and, in the process, learn about the poaching and trafficking of these animals. The company also created a video series in which a prominent conservation spokesman discusses tackling the illegal demand for pangolins.	
635. <i>(Multi-species)</i> <u>EDITORIAL</u> <u>Wildlife trade in Asia: start with the consumer.</u> Year? Funded?	MULTI-COUNTRY	▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The demand for wildlife-based traditional Asian medicine is a major driver of unsustainable and often illegal commercial exploitation of numerous species around the world</li> <li>▪ Time to reframe our view of wildlife trade from a supply-centric perspective to a demand-centric one and thus put the consumer at the heart of our strategies to tackle this threat to biodiversity</li> <li>▪ Challenges: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Some of them are inherent to the problem being tackled, such as the resistance to change that exists in human societies, especially when practices have long established cultural and social roots and the potential hostility of illegal trade syndicates</li> <li>▪ Others are related to conservation itself, such as the largely western values that characterize some conservation organizations today <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ it hampers our ability to uncover the intricate social and cultural dimensions of demand for wildlife products</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ it makes conservation efforts easy to label as foreign interference or eco-colonialism, especially given the authoritarian regimes that govern key countries in terms of demand for wildlife-based traditional Asian medicine</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Conservation will need to become a more inclusive endeavor, with greater participation from nationals in countries with demand, particularly regarding data collection and stakeholder engagement</li> </ul>
636. <i>(Tiger)</i> Ending Trade in Tiger Parts and Products. A poster by EIA.	MULTI-COUNTRY	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In 2010-2016, 35% of tigers seized suspected to be from captive operations. In the absence of forensic analysis, it is impossible to differentiate between wild and captive tiger parts and products. Tiger farming and trade in captive tiger parts and products poses serious challenge to enforcement and demand-reduction efforts.</li> <li>▪ Legal captive tiger trade exacerbates the endangered conservation status of tigers: Legalizing trade in captive tiger parts and derivatives runs the strong risk of increasing demand and poaching pressure, and expanding opportunities to sell illegal tiger products.</li> <li>▪ The IUCN has recognized “tiger farming” as “a serious threat” to the conservation of wild tigers.</li> <li>▪ Other Asian big cats are also under threat: The same market demand that leads to tiger poaching also fuels poaching of other Asian big cats</li> </ul>	<p>Recommendations for governments of China Lao PDR, Thailand and Vietnam</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Publish information on LE action against individuals and facilities engaged in illegal trade in captive tiger</li> <li>▪ Ensure there is no further expansion of existing commercial captive tiger breeding operations</li> <li>▪ Work with organizations with technical expertise in</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
637. <i>(Multi-species)</i> <u>The disappearing act. The illicit trade in wildlife in Asia.</u> June 2011. By Vanda Felbab-Brown, Foreign Policy at Brookings.	MULTI-COUNTRY	▪	<p>such as leopards and snow leopards for use in taxidermy, luxury home decor and the bone trade.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Supply-side measures: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increased law enforcement</li> <li>▪ Bans on wildlife trade</li> <li>▪ Legal supply from captivity or certified sources, such as managed legal hunting</li> <li>▪ Alternative livelihoods program</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Tackling demand: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Benefits: Tackling the demand for wildlife is critical since supply-side measures are rarely effective on their own</li> <li>▪ Costs and difficulties: Reducing demand, especially in entrenched markets in Asia, tends to be very difficult. Simply spreading awareness about the illegality of trade has proven insufficient, and improved awareness has not resulted in a substantial decline of illegal wildlife consumption in many Asian and other markets—especially in the absence of legal and sustainable protein alternatives for the poor, and among affluent consumers for whom wildlife consumption is a symbol of status. Instead, the most effective campaigns to alter demand often have been those inducing people to perceive the behavior as a threat to their health, survival, or dating prospects—a psychological reversal not easy to achieve in areas where wildlife consumption is deeply culturally entrenched. Local NGOs and lobbying groups tend to be more powerful messengers than foreign ones, whose efforts can be dismissed as culturally-insensitive and hypocritical imperialism.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ managing captive tigers to phase out tiger farms</li> </ul>
638. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Vanishing point: A study of cross-border wildlife trade between Lao PDR and Vietnam. October 1999. WWF.	MULTI-COUNTRY Bolikhamsai province, Lao PDR and Ha Tinh province, Vietnam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Investigation on both sides of the border: Lao PDR and Vietnam</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Trade network and flows</li> <li>▪ Enforcement and the law</li> <li>▪ Species in trade</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increase border police numbers and enforcement training in Lao PDR</li> <li>▪ Establish a specific wildlife patrol unit (made up of personnel from Provincial and District Forestry departments, police, customs and military) to work in crucial areas</li> <li>▪ Implement a village-level awareness program with</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
639. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Exploring cultural drivers for wildlife trade via an ethnoornithological approach: a case study of slender and	MULTI-COUNTRY Laos, Cambodia, and Thailand	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ International trade statistics and a participant–observer approach to assess culturally specific drivers for trade in lorises in South and Southeast Asia, to</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In the case of wildlife trade, culturally specific patterns are evident among different ethnic groups, even within a country. Revealing such patterns is the foundation for developing conservation management plans for each species.</li> </ul>	<p>regular follow-ups rather than simple distribution of materials</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ensure wildlife trade is on the agenda at bilateral meetings</li> <li>▪ Conduct further monitoring of wildlife trade "hot-spots"</li> <li>▪ Review legislation to combat wildlife trade and lists of prohibited and protected species in tandem with Lao PDR' application to join CITES.</li> <li>▪ This report should be used as a case study to broaden awareness and discuss information gathering strategies at provincial and district levels</li> <li>▪ Encourage co-operation between these enforcement authorities as much as possible</li> <li>▪ Design an incentive-based system to reward efficient enforcement and monitoring of wildlife trade by forestry officers</li> </ul> <p>▪ We suggest some participatory methods for each country that may aid in this process.</p>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
slow lorises (Loris and Nycticebus) in South and Southeast Asia, 2010		provide a broader context to help mitigate this practice.		
640. (Multi-species) Conspicuous Consumption and Wildlife.	MULTI-COUNTRY Vietnam	▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Elephant and rhino horns and their derivable/products</li> <li>▪ Known as conspicuous consumption, the rising cost of certain wildlife products allows users to display wealth and elite status by consuming these products. Such consumption is considered to be one of if not the primary driver behind the recent rise in the poaching of elephants and rhinos.</li> <li>▪ With prices reaching \$60,000 per kilogram, rhino horn is a status symbol in Asia and especially in Vietnam.</li> <li>▪ Rhino horn is rumored to have powerful detoxifying properties and is therefore useful as a hangover cure after excessive consumption of food and alcohol. This is likely the most common usage of rhino horn in Vietnam today.</li> <li>▪ The high price and exclusivity of rhino horn and ivory allowed these products to be viewed as extremely luxurious goods that sent a clear signal as to your social status. As these products became more available and more widely spread, the demand increased as more individuals sought to flaunt their wealth.</li> </ul>	▪
641. (Multi-species) Analysis of demand-side reduction initiatives. August 2014. Commissioned by Stop Ivory for the EPI & The Royal Foundation.	MULTI-COUNTRY Vietnam and China  To set out for the first time in one central resource a summary & analysis of the major market (or 'demand-side') initiatives carried out over	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Interviews and desktop research</li> <li>▪ Series of face-to-face interviews</li> <li>▪ Data or reports produced by organizations</li> <li>▪ Analysis of the data</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Market characteristics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ China and Viet Nam are primary demand markets</li> <li>▪ Affluence is driving demand</li> <li>▪ Rarity increases desirability</li> <li>▪ Use in traditional medicine</li> <li>▪ Growth of Africa-China trade links</li> <li>▪ Online trade as a conduit</li> <li>▪ Investment value</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Nature of demand side initiatives (130) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Demand Reduction Leaders</li> <li>▪ Species bias</li> <li>▪ Marketing techniques (such as advertising, PR and celebrity endorsement)</li> <li>▪ Online trade</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	▪



## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	<p>the last 10 years in two key consumer markets, China and Viet Nam, for four taxa: elephant, rhino, tiger &amp; pangolin and provide an overview and analysis of their findings and outputs.</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Objectives: Supply reduction and Demand reduction, with subcategories of: Research/Mapping/Data, Awareness, Education, Law Enforcement, Policy Creation, Pledge/Commitment</li> <li>▪ Consumers and their reasons to buy               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ IVORY – Drivers of demand: Growth of demand is attributed to a mix of factors, underpinned by economic growth, market liberalization, and increased affluence providing a growing segment of consumers with the economic capacity to purchase ivory                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Cultural value</li> <li>○ Opening of legal market and legal supply</li> <li>○ Illegal supply</li> <li>○ Laundering / Restricted legal supply</li> <li>○ Foreign exchange incentives</li> <li>○ Revival of carving industry</li> <li>○ Investment climate</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ IVORY – Who are the consumers, and why do they buy?                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Middle to upper classes: Social currency, luxury, investment, tradition, cultural relics, 50% described ivory as a rarity, &lt;20% associate owning with animal cruelty</li> <li>○ Female city dwellers: Souvenir, trinkets, fashion, Ornamental, 34 % believe ivory comes from elephants who die naturally</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ RHINO – Drivers of demand: A series of factors have been suggested as drivers of demand for rhino horn, which cumulatively have pushed prices to highly inflated levels and fuelled a worldwide trade thought to have been worth as much as \$9.5bn annually by 2012                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Extensive, rapid economic growth</li> <li>○ Shifting consumer attitudes– buying for status</li> <li>○ High net worth individuals and demand for luxury goods</li> <li>○ Resurgence of traditional medicine</li> <li>○ Contemporary usage as a tonic for the affluent</li> <li>○ Cancer treatment</li> <li>○ Intenders</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Extensive organized crime syndicates</li> <li>▪ RHINO – Who are the consumers, and why do they buy?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Men over 40 years old: Social currency, influence, tradition, success, health, 1/3 users said it did not matter to them if rhinos became extinct, 16% Admitted buying as a gift for their friends, colleagues, boss, government officials</li> <li>○ Older women supplying their families: Medicine, superstition, wellbeing, health, tradition, 41% Were buyers only, majority acquire for their family</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ TIGER – Drivers of demand:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Traditional medicine</li> <li>○ Whole skins</li> <li>○ Legal supply from captive breeding</li> <li>○ Tiger bone wine and legal status</li> <li>○ Online trade</li> <li>○ Rapid economic</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ TIGER – Who are the consumers, and why do they buy?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Government officials / business people: Fashion/ornamental, skins, wellness, health</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ PANGOLIN – Drivers of demand:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Traditional medicine Growing desire for consumption of meat and scales – rarity driving desirability</li> <li>○ Rapid economic growth and rising affluence</li> <li>○ Africa-Asia intercontinental trade growth</li> <li>○ International illegal trade</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ PANGOLIN – Who are the consumers, and why do they buy?               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Statesmen &amp; business people, affluent individuals: Business, status, scales/medicine, health, meat</li> <li>○ Male, higher income and educational background, younger, elite: Luxury, meat, curiosity, 26% are passive eaters consuming wildlife as food at social occasions</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
			<p><u>ANALYSIS</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Disparities in survey construction, scope, and taxa addressed, leading to a general lack of reliable definitive baseline and trend data upon which to base</li> </ul>	

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ future campaigns with the greatest efficacy and efficiency</li> <li>○ Lack of a central open source catalogue mapping all demand-side initiatives being undertaken by all actors in order to ensure effective planning, efficient resource allocation, and minimal duplication of effort</li> <li>○ Gaps in demand-side initiatives targeting a number of specific demographic groups</li> <li>○ Species specific gaps</li> <li>○ Distinguishing between the objective of campaigns to either change behavior or raise awareness may be of value, leading to further research to inform effective campaign messaging</li> </ul>	
642. <i>(Elephant)</i> Reducing desire for ivory. 2016. By Dr. Renee Lertzman and Karen Baragona	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b>  To share a set of psychosocial insights and tools for reducing consumer demand — or, as we have reframed it, desire — for ivory	▪	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ A psychosocial guide to address ivory consumption. It presents a new lens through which to view conservation campaigns and their audiences — one that takes on the complex psychological, neuroscientific, emotional, social, and cultural dimensions of ivory consumption. It is intended to support efforts that directly address the active market for these goods, including groups that are hardest to reach. This approach is not unique to ivory, yet presents an opportunity to take our work on the ivory market further.</li> <li>▪ This guide is a first step in teaching conservationists how to apply a psychosocial lens to our work. The approach it outlines is not meant to replace current campaign strategies, but to build upon their strengths and amplify their effectiveness.</li> <li>▪ Desire vs. Demand</li> <li>▪ Basic elements of the psychosocial approach to reduce demand: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Identify the unconscious, core needs consumers are trying to meet by buying ivory.</li> <li>▪ Acknowledge these needs in campaign messaging in a non-judgmental way</li> <li>▪ Redirect consumers to an alternative, “elephant- safe” way to meet their needs.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	▪
643. <i>(Multi-species)</i> Wildlife on a tightrope. An overview of wild animals in	<b>THAILAND</b> Ko Lanta; Krabi, Phuket; Phang Nga; Khao Sok; Surat Thani; Ko	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Discussion and observation</li> <li>▪ Calculation</li> <li>▪ Grading</li> </ul>	<b>ELEPHANT</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ In Thailand today, it is estimated as many as 75% of captive adult elephants used for tourism entertainment have been taken directly from the wild.</li> </ul>	▪

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
entertainment in Thailand. 2016. World Animal Protection.	Samui; Ko Phangan; Hua Hin; Bangkok; Kancharaburi; Chonburi; Pattaya; Ko Chang; Surin; Ayutthaya; Sukhothai; Lampang; Chiang Mai; Mae Rim; Mae Taeng; Chiang Rai; Mae Soi; Mae Hong Son and Pai  To assess the welfare conditions of elephant, tiger and macaque in venues across Thailand		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ All captive wild elephants will suffer a cruel and intensive breaking-in process so they can be safely used in tourism entertainment. This procedure has been handed down over generations; there are some regional variations, but they all cause intense suffering to elephants</li> <li>▪ Life in captivity for elephants: Severely inadequate conditions</li> </ul> <p><b>TIGER</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The wild tiger population is in heavy decline, with only small scattered populations left in the wild. Simultaneously, the captive population of tigers in Asia has significantly increased in the last decade. This is primarily due to tiger farms, which keep thousands of tigers</li> <li>▪ The most common reason for farming captive tigers is to meet the demand for tiger products, mainly from the Traditional Asian Medicine market. It is estimated that Chinese tiger farms hold around 5,000 tigers. This is more than the world's wild tiger population which stands at around 3,200 tigers</li> <li>▪ The Traditional Asian Medicine community states that tiger bone, the most common traded tiger product, is not required for human treatment anymore; yet wild tigers continue to be exploited and traded</li> <li>▪ Life in captivity for tigers: Severely inadequate conditions</li> </ul>	
644. (Multi-species) The Global Threat to Biodiversity from Wildlife Trade - a Major 21st Century Challenge. 2016. The Oxford Martin School's Programme on the Illegal Wildlife Trade.	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b>  To provide an international hub for interdisciplinary research into the illegal and unsustainable wildlife trade, which makes real-world impact in		<p>Case Study 2: Consumer relationships with ivory and rhino horn as luxury products in Viet Nam While in the past the main markets for rhino horn and ivory were thought to be in China, it is now widely traded in Viet Nam, with rhino horn having luxury status as a health tonic for wealthy businessmen, while both are sold as artefacts such as bangles and carved pieces. Despite substantial investment of time and resources into tackling the demand for wildlife products in Viet Nam, there is still a lack of evidence of the effectiveness of different approaches, and limited understanding of the demographics and motivations of consumers. The case study will fill this gap, answering the following questions, using methods from marketing research to understand particularly the role of wildlife products as luxury brands:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ What is the prevalence of consumption of rhino horn and ivory within an urban affluent demographic group, and through online sales?</li> </ul>	▪

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
	reducing this threat to the survival of wildlife species.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ What relationships do people have with rhino horn and ivory, compared to other luxury products?</li> <li>▪ What specific interventions are best suited to changing consumer behaviour?</li> <li>▪</li> </ul>	
645. <i>(Rhino)</i> <u>Assessment of rhino horn as a traditional medicine</u> . A report prepared for the CITES Secretariat by Kristin Nowell on behalf of TRAFFIC. April 2012	<b>MULTI-COUNTRY</b> China, Taiwan (Province of China), Japan, the Republic of Korea and Viet Nam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Literature review and information collected by non-governmental organizations (particularly TRAFFIC offices in East and Southeast Asia), and focuses on five historical consumer markets where both domestic and international trade in rhino horn is prohibited or controlled</li> <li>▪ The market selection based on a preliminary evaluation of available information as having strong traditions of medicinal use of rhino horn and varying experiences under existing rhino horn trade controls</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Structure and composition of RH                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ RH is similar, but not identical, in chemical composition to water buffalo, cattle and yak horns, which are frequently used to substitute for rhino horn in traditional medicinal formulas</li> <li>▪ RH are administered orally in powdered form in traditional medicine; Keratin supplements are sold as “alternative” medicines; However, not having much therapeutic potential by drug developers</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Scientific research on pharmacological effects of RH                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ not well researched (only one study found, but short-lived significant effect on fever in children found, but no recommendation for use)</li> <li>▪ More testing done in the laboratory, using lab animals as well as <i>in vitro</i> technique (mostly in China) - statistically significant pharmacological effects for rhino horn found: anti-pyretic, anti-inflammatory, analgesic, procoagulant, among others. The same studies also found significant pharmacological effect for animal horn substitutes.</li> <li>▪ In contrast, two studies done outside Asia (in the UK and South Africa) found no pharmacological effects at all for rhino horn or other animal horns; significant effect was found for some traditional medicinal plants tested and can be potential substitutes for RH.</li> <li>▪ A few different suggestions as to which components of rhino horn might be responsible for the observed pharmacological effects have been put forward, but no potential mechanism of action.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Use of rhino horn as a traditional medicine                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Began in China several thousand years ago, and later spread to Japan, Korea and Viet Nam</li> <li>▪ Classified as a “heat-clearing” drug with detoxifying properties, used in combination with other medicinal ingredients, resulting in a wide range of condition</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Without scientific validation, any legal use of rhino horn as a medicine to treat illness, and especially life-threatening ones, should be contemplated with caution</li> <li>▪ Rarity underpins the value rhino horn is acquiring as a luxury item and probably also contributes to the elevated and unwarranted reputation of rhino horn as a miracle medicine that can work when others fail</li> <li>▪ Rarity would seem to be the main factor, more than any intrinsic value or properties of the horn itself, coupled with rising wealth in East and Southeast Asia.</li> <li>▪ To enhance existing rhino horn trade controls, the legislative and policy, law enforcement, and demand deterrents should be considered (like illegal tiger bone trade) due to its historical medicinal reputation and current and illicit rarity.</li> </ul>

## OTHER LITERATURE

TITLE OF STUDY, YEAR	LOCATION AND OBJECTIVES	METHODOLOGY	KEY FINDINGS	RECOMMENDATIONS (IF ANY)
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ RH is being promoted by some as a cancer treatment in China and Viet Nam, but little evidence could be found. In Viet Nam, rhino horn “has recently been used as a powerful aphrodisiac” but the most common usage appears to be as a cleansing drink to soothe a hangover resulting from overconsumption of alcohol</li> <li>▪ The main medicinal distribution channel (powder or chunks of horn for grinding at home): traditional pharmacies that prepare prescriptions from dried ingredients - difficult to monitor and detect illegal trade (large numbers of shops, clinics, hospitals, pharmacies, doctors and informal doctors)</li> <li>▪ Few are willing to engage in illegal trade: (2005-2006) of nearly 450 retail pharmacies across China found just 2% claiming to stock rhino horn; In Vietnam, no such market surveys completed, but higher availability of rhino horn there, although much appears to be fake</li> <li>▪ Effective, viable and affordable substitutes for rhino horn in traditional medicine available; government and traditional medicine authorities encourage the use and most practitioners are adopting them. Consumer attitudes toward rhino horn as a medicine have been little studied (although research is underway in Viet Nam).</li> <li>▪ Growing market for rhino horn art carvings; over 190 advertisements for these found over an eight-month weekly Chinese-language internet survey in 2005-2006. In Vietnam, “rhino horn wine for millionaires”</li> </ul>	
646. (Elephant) Ivory Crush. WCS.	MULTI-COUNTRY		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ To send a strong message, the Chinese government crushed approximately 660 kg of ivory products in Beijing. More significantly, it announced the intention to ultimately cease the processing and domestic sale of ivory.</li> <li>▪ An online poll to investigate the range and strength of different opinions on this issue. Based on the results, WCS wrote a response to further introduce the negative impacts of ivory products and also advocated for a complete ban on ivory trading. These contents have been read for more than 46,000 times and have generated more than 300 interactions on social media sites.</li> </ul>	